

# INDEX



<b>Certificate</b>		
<b>Declaration</b>		<b>ii</b>
<b>Acknowledgement</b>		<b>iii</b>
<b>Preface</b>		<b>iv</b>
<b>Abbreviations</b>		<b>v</b>
<b>Table of Cases</b>		<b>viii</b>
<b>1</b>	<b>Introduction</b>	<b>1</b>
1.1	Objectives of the study	7
1.2	Scope of the study	9
1.3	Rationale of the study	10
1.4	Importance of the study	11
1.5	Utility of the study	12
1.6	Methodology adopted to conduct the study	14
1.7	Hypothesis formulated to conduct the study	15
1.8	Limitation of the study	17
1.9	Review of the Chapters	18
<b>2</b>	<b>Historical Background of Caste System and Concept of Economic Backward Classes</b>	<b>22</b>
2.1	Origin of Caste System	23
	2.1.1 Determinants of Untouchability	29
	2.1.2 Dr. Ambedkar's Entry to the march towards Reservation – 1917	32
	2.1.3 Before Simon Commission – 1930	33
	2.1.4 Franchise Committee and Communal Award – 1932	35
	2.1.5 Gandhiji's fast unto death and Reservation Policy	36
	2.1.6 Other Backward Classes	37
<b>3</b>	<b>Reservation Policy</b>	<b>51</b>
3.1	Origin of Reservation Policies	55
3.2	Reservation for the Backward Classes in India	56

3.3	Government of India Act, 1935	57
3.4	Self Immolations	60
3.5	Recommendations for Educational Concessions	62
3.6	Recommendations for Economic Upliftment	66
3.7	Reservation for OBCs	68
	3.7.1 Percentage of Reservation	69
	3.7.2 OBCs Coming on Merit	69
	3.7.3 Creamy Layer	69
	3.7.4 Effective Date	69
	3.7.5 List of OBCs	69
	3.7.6 50% Rule	70
	3.7.7 Roster	70
	3.7.8 No Reservation in Promotion	72
	3.7.9 Relaxed Standard	72
	3.7.10 Caste Certificate	73
	3.7.11 Authorities for Issuing Caste Certificate	73
	3.7.12 Migration	74
	3.7.13 No De-reservation	82
	3.7.14 Criteria for Creamy Layer	82
3.8	Reservation to Scheduled Castes, Scheduled Tribes in Universities and Colleges	85
	3.8.1 Admission of SCs and STs in Universities and Colleges	88
	3.8.2 Appointment to Teaching and Non-Teaching Posts	88
3.9	Reservation in Services for SCs, STs and OBCs in Public Sector Enterprises and Banks	90
	3.9.1 Maintenance of Rosters	90
	3.9.2 Concessions and Relaxations	95
	3.9.3 Steps to be Taken While Dealing with the Cases of SC/ST Relating to Appointments, Promotions Etc.	96
	3.9.4 Steps to be Taken While Dealing With Cases of De-reservation	98

	3.9.5 Steps to be Taken While Dealing With Cases of False Certificates	99
	3.9.6 Reservation in Allotment of Residential Accommodation for Scheduled Castes/ Scheduled Tribes	101
	3.9.7 Forwarding of Applications	102
	3.9.8 Nomination of SCs and STs on Selection Boards/ Departmental Promotion Committees	103
	3.9.9 Separate Interview for SCs and STs	104
	3.9.10 Relaxation of Persons While selecting for Posting Abroad	104
	3.9.11 SCs, STs and OBCs Coming on Own Merit	104
	3.9.12 Other Administrative Instructions in Service Training	105
3.10	Social Engineering and Protective Discrimination in Favour of Children and Women	106
3.11	Educational Rights of Minorities	107
3.12	Constitutional Safeguards of the Weaker Section Industrial Society	108
3.13	SC/ST Issues and Concerns in the Development Era: A Woman's Perspective	109
<b>4</b>	<b>Legal Aspects of Reservation with Special Reference to Indian Constitution</b>	<b>112</b>
4.1	Constitutional Provisions	114
4.2	Appointment of a Commission to Investigate the Condition of Backward Classes	118
	4.2.1 Kaka Kalelkar Commission	118
	4.2.2 Mandal Commission	119
4.3	Reservation in Electorate/Political Seats	120
4.4	Reservation in Admission to Educational Institutions	121
4.5	Reservation Extended to Self-Finance Educational Institutions (93rd Amendment)	122
4.6	Weaker Section under Article 46 and Backward Classes under Article 16(4) As Distinguished	125
4.7	Reservation in Employment	126
	4.7.1 Article 16 – Equality of Opportunity in Matter of Public Employment	126

	4.7.2	Reservation in Recruitment	127
	4.7.3	Reservation in Promotion	128
4.8		Other Reservation Related Constitutional Provision/ Amendments	129
4.9		Backlog Vacancies Not to be Included in 50% Ceiling	131
4.10		Other Miscellaneous Constitutional Provisions	133
4.11		Reservation under IX <sup>th</sup> Schedule of Constitution	134
4.12		Reservation in Non-Aided Educational Institutions	136
4.13		Accumulation of Backlog	136
	4.13.1	No Seniority on Promotion	137
	4.13.2	Change in Roster System	138
	4.13.3	Withdrawal of Concessions	139
	4.13.4	No Reservation in Promotion	139
	4.13.5	Backlog Vacancies	140
	4.13.6	Reservation of Change in Religion	140
4.14		Whether Reservations are Mandatory or Only Enabling Provisions	143
4.15		Legislations	145
	4.15.1	The Protection of Civil Rights Act, 1955	145
	4.15.2	The Protection of Civil Rights Rules, 1977	148
	4.15.3	The Scheduled Castes and The Scheduled Tribes (Prevention of Atrocities) Act, 1989	149
	4.15.4	The Scheduled Castes and The Scheduled Tribes (Prevention of Atrocities) Rules, 1989	156
	4.15.5	The National Commission for Backward Classes Act, 1993	161
	4.15.6	The Gujarat Backward Classes Development Corporation Act, 1985	163
	4.15.7	The Gujarat Scheduled Castes Development Corporation Act, 1985	168
	4.15.8	Employment of Manual Scavenger and Construction of Dry Latrine (Prohibition) Act, 1993	169
<b>5</b>		<b>Protective Discrimination: Implementation of Reservation Policy</b>	<b>170</b>
5.1		In Educational Area	173

5.2	The Commissioner for Scheduled Castes and Scheduled Tribes	185
	5.2.1 Appointment	185
	5.2.2 Functions	186
5.3	Liaison Officers	188
	5.3.1 Responsibility of Liaison Officer for Implementation of Reservation Orders	189
5.4	Discrimination against Scheduled Castes and Scheduled Tribes	191
	5.4.1 Recommendation of the Parliamentary Committee on Welfare of SC/ST	192
	5.4.2 Liaison Officers and Special Cells	193
	5.4.3 Annual Statements	194
	5.4.4 Prior Approval of De-Reservation	194
5.5	National Commission for Scheduled Castes and Scheduled Tribes	195
	5.5.1 Functions	196
	5.5.2 Investigation into and Monitoring of Safeguards Provided Under the Constitutional Law and Order	196
	5.5.3 Inquiry into Specific Order	196
	5.5.4 Socio-Economic Development	198
	5.5.5 Powers of the Commission to Act as A Civil Court	201
5.6	General Information	201
	5.6.1 Safeguards against Harassment	201
	5.6.2 Safeguards against Super-session	202
5.7	District Welfare Officer, Liaison Officers and the National Commission for SC/ST	203
	5.7.1 SC/ST Cell	204
	5.7.2 Interaction with the Commission	205
5.8	Committee of Parliament on Welfare of SC/ST	205
	5.8.1 The Recruitment Process	206
	5.8.2 Setting Up of Cell for Enforcement of Reservation Order	206
	5.8.3 Follow-up Action on Complaints Received by	207

	the Commission for SC/ST	
	5.8.4 Inspection of Rosters by Liaison Officer	208
	5.8.5 Name of Offices	210
5.9	Complaints Sent to Commissioner by SC/ST Employees in Service Matters	211
<b>6</b>	<b>Judicial and Legal Response</b>	<b>213</b>
6.1	Indian Supreme Court on Reservation with Reference to Constitutional Provisions	215
6.2	Reservation in India: Time-Line	221
	6.2.1 Madhya Pradesh Rajya Sahakari Bank Maryadit v. State of Madhya Pradesh	224
	6.2.2 State of Maharashtra v. Sanjay K. Nimje	225
	6.2.3 Ashok Kumar Thakur v. Union of India	225
	6.2.4 Rajesh Kumar Daria v. Rajasthan Public Service Commission	228
	6.2.5 Mahesh Gupta v. Yashwant Kumar Ahirwar	228
	6.2.6 Shiv Prasad v. Government of India and Others	229
	6.2.7 Pushpa Rani v. Union of India	230
	6.2.8 Vinod Kumar R.V. v. University of Bhavnagar	231
	6.2.9 Kerala Public Service Commission v. Cochin University	232
	6.2.10 Indra Sawhney v. Union of India and Aftermath – Conflicts of Judiciary and Politics	232
	6.2.11 S. Vinod Kumar v. Union of India	236
	6.2.12 Ramesh M. Parmar v. State of Gujarat and Others	238
	6.2.13 Union of India v. Virpal Singh Chauhan and Ajit Singh Jauja v. State of Punjab	242
	6.2.14 Dr. Pradeep Jain etc. v. Union of India and Others	244
	6.2.15 Akhil Bharatiya Soshit Karmachari Sangh (Railway) v. Union of India	246
	6.2.16 Bihar v. Mukund Sah	246
	6.2.17 Ajitsingh v. State of Punjab	246
	6.2.18 N.T.R. University of Health Sciences v. Babu	247

	Rajendra Prasad	
	6.2.19 General Manager, Southern Railway v. Rangachavi	247
	6.2.20 State Bank of India SC/ST Employees Welfare Association v. State Bank of India	247
	6.2.21 C.A. Rajendra v. Union of India	248
	6.2.22 Janardan Subbarye v. State of Mysore	248
	6.2.23 Rajendra v. State of Madras	249
	6.2.24 Shrimati Champakam v. State of Madras	250
	6.2.25 Madhuri Patil v. Additional Commissioner	250
	6.2.26 Kalasika Prashanta Kumar v. State of Andhra Pradesh	250
	6.2.27 Hanmant Ramhari Ghodake v. State of Maharashtra	251
	6.2.28 Nair Service Society v. Dr. T. Beermasthan and Others	251
	6.2.29 Wilson Reade v. C. S. Booth	252
	6.2.30 Muthusamy Mudaliar v. Masilman Muddaliar	257
	6.2.31 M. A. Kuttappan v. E. Krishnan Nayar and Others	258
	6.2.32 Ghanshyam Kishan Borikar v. L.D. Engineering College and Others	260
6.3	Reservation Extended to Self-Finance Educational Institutions (93rd Constitutional Amendment)	261
6.4	Base of Reservation: Caste or Economic?	263
6.5	Carry Forward	264
6.6	Ground Reality and the Real Way Ahead	265
6.7	Alternatives to Affirmative Action	266
6.8	Last Submission	270
<b>7</b>	<b>Conclusion &amp; Suggestions</b>	<b>273</b>
7.1	Conclusion	274
	7.1.1 Upliftment of Poorest Irrespective of Caste Consideration	279
	7.1.2 Sensitizing State Administration	280

	7.1.3 Relief Given to the Victim	287
7.2	Suggestions	288
<b>Bibliography</b>		<b>xi</b>
<b>Annexure</b>		<b>xvi</b>
Annexure I	Model Roster of Reservation With Reference to Post for Direct Recruitment on All India Basis by Open Competition	<b>xvii</b>
Annexure II	Direct Recruitment on all India Basis by Open Competition	<b>xviii</b>
Annexure III	Model Roster for Post Filled by Promotion	<b>xx</b>
Annexure IV	Roster for Direct Recruitment on All India Basis Otherwise Than Through Open Competition for Cadre Strength Up to 13 Posts	<b>xxii</b>
Annexure V	Model Roster of Reservation With Reference to Posts for Direct Recruitment on All India Basis by Open Competition	<b>xxiv</b>
Annexure VI	100 Points Roster for Recruitment Made on Local for Regional Basis	<b>xxv</b>