APPENDIX IV

Analysis Of Experts' Comments On The Draft Of Academic Culture

The concept of Academic Culture developed by the researcher (enclosed in Appendix I) was critically examined by experts at national level. The experts were senior Professors of Education holding senior positions in Indian Universities. Critical comments were solicited with respect to:

The four constructs identified – freedom, equality, respect and a sense of responsibility.

The three categories of stakeholders identified – learners, teachers and principal.

Elaboration / delineation of each construct

Any other dimension/ construct that may be included in the concept of academic culture.

Comment / observation in general.

Comments received from experts were of two types: (i) overall general statements and/or questions; and (ii) suggestions for delineation of construct in the write up. These comments were analysed employing the technique of content analysis. The comments were categorized into the following categories:

1 Adequacy of the constructs identified;

2 Adequacy of the stakeholders identified; and

3 Appropriateness of the delineation of each construct;

4 General / overall comments.

A tabular presentation of the above main categories for classification of the data and the subsequent sub categories is presented.

A tabular presentation of the main categories and sub categories for classification of data

1	2	3	4			
Adequacy of the four constructs	Adequacy of the three stakeholders	Appropriateness of the delineation of the constructs	Overall/ General Comments			
		3.1 Overall ·comprehensiveness in the delineation of constructs	3.2 Appropriateness of the delineation of construct /suggestions for modifications			
			3.2.1 Freedom	3.2.2 Equality	3.2.3 Respect	3.2.4 A Sense Of Responsi-bility

The data thus classified were examined to derive suggestions to strengthen the concept. The data in each individual category are discussed in detail. The indications in each category are presented with a discussion for the implications for strengthening the concept of Academic Culture.

1 Adequacy of the four constructs

Sr. No.	Adequacy of four construct/ Suggestion/s for additional Construct
1	The four construct are adequate
2	The four constructs are adequate.
3	Additional construct can be Spiritual / Ethical aspect. All the four constructs must be considered in the perspective of spiritual values.
4	The four constructs are adequate. .
5	No comment
6	No comment
7	The constructs identified by the researcher are no doubt crucial for academic excellence. Quality essentially in every aspect of school operation including three major human elements, namely, teacher, student and principal. The researcher can delineate the various aspects of quality to be addressed by each of the human elements.
8	The four constructs are adequate Why only the four constructs? What is the rationale? There could be many so strengthen the identification of these four constructs in the chapter / theoretical background. Spirituality as a dimension . Take an open view of spirituality and avoid regiosity.
9	No comment
10	No comment Freedom needs to be studied in greater variety.
11	Adequate

The above data indicates that the judgement of the eleven experts regarding the adequacy of the four constructs is as follows: .

Five experts confirmed the adequacy of the four constructs.

Four experts did not offer any disagreement and any specific comment on it.

Two experts suggested spirituality as an additional construct.

One expert confirmed the appropriateness of the four constructs and also suggested quality as an additional construct.

It may be derived from the above analysis that most of the experts have confirmed the adequacy of our constructs identified. The suggestion of two additional constructs – spirituality and quality – was reflected on.

Spirituality as additional construct

It was suggested to view spirituality as an additional construct, to consider it as a dimension cutting across the four constructs and as a part of academic culture. Spirituality is the overall view of life reflected in the social, intellectual and emotional maturity of an individual. Spirituality is reflected in maturity of response to self and others. By implication, freedom, equality, respect and a sense of responsibility reflect aspects of spirituality. It was thus decided not to focus on it directly, though it would be discussed in the theoretical background preceding the concept and also in discussion of data.

Quality as an additional construct

It was suggested to view quality as an additional construct. The academic culture as visualized would lead to quality. Quality thus would be a goal to achieve if the academic culture is created and nurtured. Therefore quality cannot be considered as a construct.

It was thus decided to accept partially the suggestion for spirituality as an additional construct. It would not be considered as a separate construct. Aspects of spirituality would be integrated in the theoretical background and discussion of data. It was decided not to accept the suggestion of quality as a construct

2 Adequacy of the three stakeholders

Sr. No.	Observation / Suggestion/s regarding stakeholders
1	What about the support staff? What about the internal and the external world? The networking with external organizations is also important.
2	The three stakeholders are appropriate
3	No comment
4	The voice of parents needs to be considered in freedom, respect, equality and sense of responsibility
5	Since the study is developing concept, the concept must be broadly developed so include primary and secondary factors. Later the empirical data can be restricted to the primary factors (Teacher, Learner, Principal) Three stakeholders are limiting so a need to include management also (it is important in the context of self financed and private educational institutions) Also include -Rules and regulations(often culture is born out of rules and regulations) -Management
6	The management, the academic leadership is important. Think about it. Mechanism of smooth, peaceful and meaningful administration Development of student and teachers: the parameters of these to be developed/ thought about
7	The three stakeholders are adequate
8	No comments
9	*Suggestions regarding stakeholders*: What about other stakeholders (1) management body (2) parents ? There are many common points where Learners, Teachers and Principals share where as there are specific points different for different groups.
10	No comments
11	Add parents also of diverse types educated, illiterate

The above data indicates that the judgement of the eleven experts regarding the adequacy of the three stakeholders (learner, teacher and principal) is as follows:

Two experts confirmed adequacy of the three stakeholders identified

Two experts suggested including parents as additional stakeholders

Two experts suggested including management as additional stakeholder. One of these two experts suggested classifying the stakeholders as primary and secondary stakeholders.

One expert suggested parents and management both as additional stakeholders

One expert suggested including support staff as an additional stakeholder

Three experts offered no comments on the adequacy of the three stakeholders. At the same time, they also did not voice any disagreement on them.

It may be derived from the above analysis that a need for including additional stakeholders was indicated by the experts. The additional stakeholders suggested were- parents, management and support staff. The pros and cons of including each additional stakeholder were deliberated on.

Parents and management as additional stakeholders

Various arguments in favour of including these two stakeholders given by experts were(i) these two stakeholders indirectly influence school; (ii)the parents' voice is also a major contributor to the generation of academic culture; (iii) the management's influence on working of a school cannot be ignored.

After due contemplation it was decided not to include these two more stakeholders in the concept on the bases of the following arguments:

> The voice and concern of Parents and Management has a direct impact on the functioning of school by influencing the philosophy and the policy of the school in its manifestation in the everyday life of a school. However, it is the principal who translates the philosophy and the policy into action by understanding it, interpreting it and re-interpreting it. The principal thus becomes a channel for a link with regulatory processes and powers that influences the functioning of a school.

One of the experts recommended identifying learner, teacher and principal as primary stakeholders and parents and management as secondary stakeholders. In keeping with the import of the research questions, this study takes principal learner and teacher as the primary source while parents and management as secondary source of data in understanding stakeholders engagement in school in the making of Academic Culture.

The re examination of the concept as developed by researcher revealed that the academic culture was generated and sustained by the interactions in the collective endeavour of the principal, teachers and learners in their pursuit of knowledge. The pursuit of knowledge occurs primarily between the teacher/s and the learner/s at school level. Simultaneously the same pursuit also occurs between learner/s and learner/s; and teacher/s and teacher/s. These three stakeholders interact intensely and regularly. It is the dynamics of the interactions between these three stakeholders that generates academic culture. The influence of parents and management as stakeholders on the overall working of school is a reality which is acknowledged and engaged with in this research as a secondary source.

Support staff as additional stakeholder

The support staff in a school provides administrative support to facilitate functioning of a school. It functions on the policy guidelines developed by the management and executed by the principal as a representative of the management. The intensity of its involvement in the regular interactions for the pursuit of knowledge is less. Thus it was decided that it cannot be considered as an additional stakeholder.

It was thus decided to keep the focus on principal, learner and teacher as primary source while taking management and parents as secondary source in the making of academic culture.

3 Appropriateness of the delineation of the constructs

The comments received from the experts were classified into two categories: (i) overall comprehensiveness of the delineation of constructs and (ii) appropriateness of the delineation / suggestions for modifications.

3.1 Overall Comprehensiveness of the delineation of construct

Sr. No.	Overall comprehensiveness in the delineation of constructs
1	Constructs are delineated comprehensively
2	Appropriate delineation
3	No comments
4	No comments
5	No comment
6	Constructs are well developed
7	No comments
8	The delineation is appropriate
9	No comments
10	No comments
11	Comprehensive

The above data indicates that five experts confirmed the overall comprehensiveness and appropriateness of the delineations of each construct. Six experts did not comment on it neither did they offer any disagreements on it. The opinions of experts in this category were also examined in view of the comments offered for modifications in some aspect in the delineation of the construct presented in Table 3.2

All the experts' comments received in the second category (appropriateness of the

delineation / suggestions for modifications) were pooled together under the category of each specific construct-freedom, respect, equality and a sense of responsibility. This was done in order to get an overall view of the modifications to be made for that particular construct. The data thus obtained are presented below:

3.2 Appropriateness of the delineation of construct / suggestions for modifications.

3.2.1   Freedom

Sr. No.	Freedom
1	Replace the term 'freedom' by 'autonomy'.
2	Need to clarify whether freedom is viewed within an institution or in educational organizations in general.
3	It is suggested that a wide variety of freedom is observed in a variety of institutions.
4	The nature and area of freedom in an institution within the framework of the institutional rules and regulation needs to be thought about. In this suggestion is to consider formal programs and informal support system in delineating freedom.
5	Provide assumptions for the description of freedom for learners.
6	Need to clarify freedom of learners in assembly.
7	The expression 'the opportunity and adequate time given to learners' is reframed as 'the opportunity and adequate time available to learners'.
8	Need to clarify 'freedom to think and express' and 'be helped to do so'. It is commented that there is a difference between the two.
9	Freedom for learners outside the sites for learning is commented as deceptive and elusive from point of view of study.
10	Aspects of discipline to be considered in delineating freedom for learners outside the sites for learning.
11	The expression 'silences of learner' is replaced by 'silence of learners'.
12	Learner's freedom to include freedom to contribute to and be a part of decision making process which affects the teaching learning process in school and the general management related to it.

13	The role perception of learners and the question of whether the learners are aware of his/her role needs to be clarified
14	In the description of freedom for teacher, it is suggested to add 'orientation to freedom: knowledge to all including teachers / learners and support staff.' as an aspect of freedom for learners, teachers and support staff.
15	The question of matching learner autonomy and teacher autonomy needs to be addressed. Here, various agreements and conflicts may be considered.
16	In the description of freedom for principal to develop philosophy of school, the term develop is replaced by 'evolve' / 'chalk out'

The above data indicates that suggestions received can be classified as (i) suggestions for adding dimensions to the delineation of the construct freedom; (ii) suggestions for further reflections such as: Is freedom visualized as institution specific or in general for educational organizations and; a wide variety of freedom could be observed in different types of institutions. These suggestions were reflected on.

Suggestions for adding dimensions to the delineation of the construct freedom;

Suggestions for additions, modifications and revision (serial no. 5,6,7,8,9,10,11,12,13,15 and 16) were accepted. The suggestion (serial no. 14 was partially accepted. The orientation to freedom : knowledge for all would be mentioned for teachers and learners and not support staff as support staff is not considered as a stakeholder.

The suggestion to change the term 'freedom' by 'autonomy' was reflected upon. The term freedom is a wider term philosophically than the term autonomy. Also, it was felt by the researcher that the change in the term would not make significant difference to the concept. Thus it was decided to retain the term 'freedom'

(ii) Suggestions for further reflections

Since the concept of Academic Culture is developed as a normative concept, it is visualized for educational organizations in general. It would hence encompass the wide variety of freedom existing in different types of academic institutions.

3.2.2 Equality

Sr. No.	Equality
1	It was commented that equality looked equality appears ideal in isolation.
2	Suggestion to operationalise 'growth and development' in the delineation of equality for learners.
3	Suggestion to operationalise 'equal access to learning opportunities' in the delineation of equality for learners.
4	Suggestion to clarify the observance of equality of and its practice in the delineation of equality for learner outside sites for learning i.e., classroom, laboratory and library but in school premises like assembly, playground and corridors. The specific points for this were-- -operationalise 'neutral language' in the delineation of equality for learners. -clarify 'who would recognize different types of learners'

The above data indicates that suggestions received can be classified as (i) suggestions for adding dimensions to the delineation of the construct equality; (ii) suggestions for further reflections such as: "Equality looks ideal in isolation". The following was reflected on.

Suggestions for adding dimensions to the delineation of the construct equality

Suggestions for additions, modifications and revision (serial no.2, 3 and 4) were accepted.

Suggestions for further reflections

It was suggested that equality looks ideal in isolation.

3.2.3   Respect

Sr. No.	Respect
1	.The visualization of respect as a construct in the initial part appears highly diffused. It therefore needs to be concretised.
2.	It was suggested that respect is also seen in recognizing a sense of responsibility in learner, teacher and principal.
3	In the description of respect for learners, the term ' differentiated instruction' is to be operationalised
4	In exhibiting respect by accepting low achievers (learners), it was suggested to include progressive ones, handicapped ones and impaired ones also.
5	In respect for teacher the parents/community perspective is to be considered.
6	One of the points for respect for principal was delineated as readiness with which the decision taken is implemented by teachers and learners. In this, it was suggested to add that readiness is to be shown by the principal him/herself also.
7	Respect for principal needs to be viewed in relation to the organizational structure / climate.

The above data indicates that suggestions received can be classified as (i) suggestions for adding dimensions to the delineation of the construct respect; (ii) suggestions for further reflections. The following was reflected on.

Suggestions for adding dimensions to the delineation of the construct respect

Suggestions for additions, modifications and revision (serial no.1, 2, 3, 4, 5 and 6) were accepted. The suggestion to include parents' and community perspective for respect for teachers (serial no. 5) was made. This perspective already exists as the parents' voice and community views influence the school philosophy and its management policy through principal. Yet this would be re emphasized.

Suggestions for further reflections

It was suggested that respect for principal be viewed with respect to organizational structure and climate. Since the concept of Academic Culture is developed as a normative concept, it is visualized for educational organizations in general. It would hence encompass the wide variety of organizational structures and climate existing in different types of academic institutions. The temporal reality for delineation of respect for principal indirectly considers organizational structures and climate but does not restrict it self to any particular type.

3.2.4 A Sense of Responsibility

Sr. No.	A Sense of Responsibility
1	The term 'a sense of responsibility' be replaced by the term 'accountability'

The above data indicates that only one suggestion to change the term 'a sense of responsibility' by 'accountability' was received. This was reflected upon. The term 'a sense of responsibility' is a wider term philosophically than the term accountability. Also, it was felt by the researcher that the change in the term would not make significant difference to the concept. Thus it was decided to retain the term 'a sense of responsibility'.

4. Overall / General Comments

Sr. No.	Overall / General comments
1	Need to establish external and internal linkages. The internal links are appropriate.
2	Forces that act on survival of the system and its sustainability need to be clarified.
3	The idea of discipline is to be incorporated.
4	The empirical findings could be from a wide variety of schools to bring comprehensiveness to the construct. So the sample needs to have diversity.
5	The empirical findings could be from a school which the researcher might think would possess a rich academic culture.
6	The constructs could be studied under the broader umbrella of philosophy of education.
7	It was remarked that the concept appears to be utopian. It appeared to be appropriate for democratic society/culture. Would it be appropriate for other types of culture?

8	Some sentences were reframed in the introductory write up on the concept of Academic culture.
	(i) "Each academic institution develops its own philosophy, vision and mission as the guiding framework for the pursuit of knowledge."
	This is reframed as-
	"Each academic institution follows its own philosophy, vision and mission as the guiding framework for its functioning."
	(ii) "Stakeholders in an academic institution-learner, teacher and the principal/head-interact with each other in the pursuit of knowledge within the philosophy, the mission and the vision developed by the individual."
	This is reframed as-
	""Stakeholders in an academic institution-learner, teacher and the principal/head-interact with each other in the pursuit of knowledge within the framework of its philosophy, the mission and the vision."
	(iii) "A culture is created and sustained collectively by the interactions of the stakeholders in their endeavour for the pursuit of knowledge"
	This is reframed as-
	"The academic culture is created and sustained collectively by the interactions of the stakeholders in their endeavour for the pursuit of knowledge"
	The term 'a sense of responsibility' is replaced by the term 'accountability'.

The above data provided a miscellaneous group of suggestions which were categorised as: (i) suggestions to refocus and sharpen the introductory write up on the concept of Academic Culture; and (ii) suggestions for sample to strengthen empirical findings. These suggestions were reflected on.

Suggestions to refocus and sharpen the introductory write up on the concept of Academic Culture

The suggestion to establish external linkages well would be considered. The suggestion to focus on the forces that act on survival of the system and its sustainability are in a way subsumed under the former suggestion. It, however, would be clarified and re emphasized.

The suggestion to incorporate the idea of discipline would be considered. It is indirectly subsumed under the construct- a sense of responsibility. This would be re focused.

The suggestion to study the four construct under the broader umbrella of philosophy of education was deliberated on. The philosophy of education helps to provide a guiding framework but the academic culture is generated and nurtured in the field. Thus the two are distinct.

The question of Academic Culture being utopian and appropriate for only democratic culture was reflected on. The utopian nature of the concept developed was necessary as it was developed as a normative concept. Its appropriateness largely for democratic culture was accepted. But aspects of this culture could certainly be observed and followed in other cultures also. But overall this particular bias was accepted.

The suggestions for modifications/ reframing of sentence structure (serial number 8) were accepted.

Suggestions for sample to strengthen empirical findings.

There were to suggestions in all of which one was to study a school possessing the academic culture visualized and one not possessing it. Another suggestion was to deliberately bring in a variety in sample so that a comprehensive picture of Academic culture could be developed.

It was decided to study effective and the best schools which would have a high probability of possessing a rich academic culture.

Implications for the final modifications in the concept of Academic Culture

On the basis of the preceding analysis of the experts' comments and due deliberations, it was finally decided that the suggestions which would strengthen the concept would

be accepted. At the same time some other suggestions would not to be accepted.

Suggestions which were accepted are:

To consider spirituality as a dimension cutting across the four constructs and to integrate it in the discussion of data.

To strengthen the delineation of the construct by making due modifications as suggested:

establishing external linkages,

refocusing the idea of discipline

(ii) modifications suggested in the delineation of each construct in-

Table 3. 2.1- (Serial number 5,6,7,8,9,10,11,12,13,15 and16); The suggestion (serial no. 14 was partially accepted. The orientation to freedom : knowledge for all would be mentioned for teachers and learners and not support staff as support staff is not considered as a stakeholder.

Table 3.2.2- (Serial number 2,3 and 4) and;

Table 3.2.3-(Serial number 1,2,3,4,5 and 6).

Suggestions which were not accepted are:

The additional stakeholders: parents, management and support staff be not included in the concept.

In view of the above implications, the concept of Academic Culture (enclosed in Appendix I) was duly modified. The modified version of the concept is presented in chapter I