

# **CONTENTS**

	<b>Page No.</b>
<i>Certificate</i>	
<i>Declaration</i>	
<i>Acknowledgement</i>	<b>i</b>
<i>Dedication</i>	
<i>Contents</i>	<b>iv</b>
<i>Chapter I to IX</i>	<b>1-558</b>
<i>Bibliography</i>	<b>xvii</b>
<i>Table of Cases</i>	<b>xxxii</b>
<b><u>CHAPTER I</u></b>	<b>1</b>
<b>INTRODUCTION</b>	<b>2-41</b>
<b>1.1</b> Introduction	<b>3</b>
<b>1.2</b> A Bird's Eye View Of The Earlier    Studies	<b>16</b>
<b>1.3</b> Importance/Significance Of The Study	<b>17</b>
<b>1.4</b> Rationale Of The Study	<b>19</b>
<b>1.5</b> Introduction To Some Basic Concepts	<b>21</b>
1.5.1      Limited Government	<b>21</b>
1.5.2      Judicial Review	<b>22</b>
1.5.3      Separation of powers	<b>23</b>
1.5.4      Rule of Law	<b>25</b>
1.5.5      Parliamentary Sovereignty	<b>27</b>
1.5.6      Due process of Law	<b>29</b>
1.5.7      Doctrine of Basic Structure	<b>30</b>
<b>1.6</b> Scope Of The Study	<b>31</b>

<b>1.7</b>	Objectives Of The Study	33
<b>1.8</b>	Hypothesis	33
<b>1.9</b>	Research Questions	34
<b>1.10</b>	Limitations Of The Study	35
<b>1.11</b>	Research Methodology	35
<b>1.12</b>	Scheme Of The Study	36
<b>1.13</b>	Utility Of The Study	40

## **CHAPTER II** **42**

### **DOCTRINE OF JUDICIAL REVIEW: ITS ORIGIN, GROWTH AND DEVELOPMENT IN U.K., U.S.A. AND INDIA** **43-109**

<b>2.1</b>	Meaning And Significance Of Judicial Review	47
<b>2.2</b>	Concept of Judicial Review In The European Legal Philosophy	55
<b>2.3</b>	Evolution of The English Constitution And Doctrine Of Judicial Review	57
2.3.1	Three Stages of Evolution	57
2.3.2	Reason For The Non-existence Of Judicial Review In England	61
<b>2.4</b>	Evolution Of The American Constitution And Doctrine Of Judicial Review	62
2.4.1	Historical Background	62
2.4.2	Nature and Objects of Judicial Review in USA	68
2.4.3	Origin and Growth of Judicial Review in USA	70

2.4.3.1	Pre-Marshall Age	70
2.4.3.2	The Age of Marshall	75
2.4.3.3	The Age of Taney	81
2.4.3.4	The Period of Judicial Constitution Making	82
2.4.3.5	The Period of New Deal	83
2.4.3.6	The New Era	86
2.4.4	Judicial Review in U.S.A.- How far it was contended by the framers of the U.S. Constitution	88
<b>2.5</b>	<b>Evolution, Growth And Development Of The Doctrine Of Judicial Review In India</b>	<b>90</b>
2.5.1	Judicial Review as a Part of Indian Heritage	90
2.5.2	Constitutional Growth of Judicial Review	92
2.5.2.1	From Regulating Act to Mutiny (1773-1857)	93
2.5.2.2	The Beginning of the Evolution of the Indian Constitution (1858-1884)	93
2.5.2.3	Birth of the Indian National Congress (1885-1920)	94
2.5.2.4	Direct Constitutional Movement (1921- March 1937)	95
2.5.2.5	Working of Federation (April 1937- Aug. 1947)	96
2.5.2.6	Establishment of the Indian Sovereignty (15 Aug.1947-Jan. 1950)	97
2.5.2.7	Inauguration of the New Constitution of Free India and its Working (26 Jan. to the Present)	97
2.5.3	Recognition and Development of Judicial Review After Independence	98

**INTERCONNECTION AMONG THE DOCTRINES OF  
JUDICIAL REVIEW, RULE OF LAW, SEPARATION OF  
POWERS AND DUE PROCESS OF LAW 110-164**

<b>3.1</b>	Rule Of Law	111
3.1.1	Concept of Rule of Law	111
3.1.2	Origin and Nature of Rule of Law	113
3.1.3	Rule of Law: Dicey's Theory	115
3.1.4	Rule of Law and Indian Constitution	119
3.1.5	Rule of Law and Judicial Review	121
<b>3.2</b>	Doctrine of Separation Of Powers	128
3.2.1	Concept of Doctrine of Separation of Powers	128
3.2.2	Doctrine of Separation of Powers – Structural classification	133
3.2.3	Doctrine of Separation of Powers and Indian Constitution	134
3.2.4	Doctrine of Separation of Power and Judicial Review	135
3.2.5	Doctrine of separation of Powers: Present Trend	138
<b>3.3</b>	Due Process Of Law	139
3.3.1	Concept of Due Process of Law	139
3.3.2	Due Process of Law and Indian Constituent Assembly	142
3.3.3	Due Process and Indian Constitution	145
3.3.4	Due Process of Law and Judicial Review	150
<b>3.4</b>	Judiciary v. Parliament: Present Instances	155

## **CHAPTER IV**

**165**

### **PROVISIONS RELATING TO JUDICIAL REVIEW AND ITS DEVELOPMENT UNDER THE INDIAN CONSTITUTION**

**166-223**

<b>4.1.</b>	Judicial Review Before The Commencement Of The Indian Constitution	168
4.1.1.	Under the Government of India Act, 1858	168
4.1.2.	Working of Judicial Review under the Government of India Act, 1935	169
4.1.3.	Concept of Judicial Review during the making of the Constitution	171
<b>4.2.</b>	Judicial Review Under The Present Constitution (1950 and onwards)	173
4.2.1.	Basic Constitutional principles for the exercise of judicial review power.	177
4.2.2.	Purpose of Judicial Review power	178
4.2.3.	Subject of Judicial Review power	178
4.2.4.	Effect of Judicial Review power	179
4.2.5.	Significance of the power of Judicial Review	180
4.2.6.	Factors nourishing the doctrine of Judicial Review in India	180
<b>4.3.</b>	Constitutional Provisions For The exercise Of Judicial Review Power In India	180
<b>4.4</b>	Grounds For The Exercise Of Judicial Review Power	191
4.4.1	Absence of legislative competency to enact a particular statute	194
4.4.2	Statute against the particular provision of the Constitution or contradicts the philosophy of the Constitution	195
4.4.3	Constitutional amendment contradicts with the	196

	basic philosophy of the Constitution	
4.4.4	Misuse of the executive power	206
4.4.5	Delegation of essential legislative power	212
4.4.6	Revival of void statutes	213
4.4.7	Giving extra-territorial operation to state legislation	213
<b>4.5.</b>	<b>Limitation On The Exercise Of Judicial Review Power In India</b>	<b>214</b>
4.5.1	Constitutional Limitations	215
4.5.2	Intrinsic Limitations	217
4.5.3	Self-imposed Limitations	217

## **CHAPTER V**

	<b>224</b>
<b>PARLIAMENT'S ATTEMPT TO TAKE AWAY JUDICIAL REVIEW POWER</b>	<b>225-300</b>

<b>5.1.</b>	<b>Property Rights: Court v. Parliament</b>	<b>229</b>
5.1.1.	Concept of Property Right	229
5.1.2.	Recognition of the right to property	231
5.1.3.	Right to Property and Constituent Assembly Debate	234
5.1.4.	The (Constitution First Amendment) Act	239
5.1.5.	The (Constitution Fourth Amendment) Act, 1955	244
5.1.6.	The (Constitution Seventeenth Amendment) Act	249
5.1.7.	The Constitution (Twenty-fifth Amendment) Act	264
<b>5.2.</b>	<b>The (Constitution Forty-second Amendment) Act,</b>	<b>278</b>

	1976: Curbing of Judicial Review Power	
5.2.1	Aims and Objectives	280
5.2.2	Major Changes	282
5.2.3	The (Constitution Forty-second Amendment) Act: Some Provisions	282
<b>5.3</b>	Functions Of President And Governors: Court v. Parliament	290
5.3.1	Political power: a Forbidden Territory for judges	291
5.3.2	Emergency and limitation on judicial power	292

## **CHAPTER VI 300**

### **JUDICIAL REVIEW OF CONSTITUTIONAL AMENDMENT 301-397**

<b>6.1.</b>	Nature of Constituent Power	303
<b>6.2.</b>	Amending Process and Power in the Indian Constitution	308
6.2.1	Plenary power of Amendment	311
6.2.2	History of amending power	312
6.2.3	Provision for Amendment under the Indian Constitution	318
6.2.4	Amending Procedure	327
6.2.5	Supreme Court on the Wording of Article 368	328
6.2.6	Amendment: Meaning	330
<b>6.3.</b>	Judicial Review of Constitutional Amendments: A	331

	unique experience of India	
6.3.1	Constitution First Amendment	333
6.3.2	Constitution Fourth Amendment	338
6.3.3	Constitution Seventeenth Amendment	339
6.3.4	Constitution Twenty- fourth, Twenty- fifth, Twenty- ninth Amendment	347
6.3.5	Emergence of the Basic Structure Concept- the Keshavananda milestone	352
6.3.6	The Constitution Thirty-second Amendment	364
6.3.7	The Constitution (Thirty-ninth Amendment) Act	365
6.3.8	The constitution Fortieth Amendment	373
6.3.9	The Constitution Forty-second Amendment Act	374
6.3.10	The Constitution Fifty-second Amendment Act	376
6.4.	Justification for the judicial review of Constitutional Amendments	379
6.5.	Judicial Review of some Constitutional Amendment in U.S.A.	382
6.6.	Doctrine Of Political Question And Judicial Review	388
6.7	Whether the Indian Supreme Court works as a political institution in exercising judicial review power?	392



**CHAPTER VII** **398**

**JUDICIAL REVIEW-JUDICIAL ACTIVISM-  
JUDICIAL RESTRAINT** **399-438**

<b>7.1</b>	Expansion of judicial Review Power	400
<b>7.2</b>	Judicial Activism	405
<b>7.2.1</b>	Judicial Activism And Constitutional Amendments	412
<b>7.3</b>	Judicial Restraint And The Basic Structure Doctrine	420
<b>7.4</b>	Judicial Activism And Judicial Restraint: Pre-emergency Era	423
<b>7.5</b>	Judicial Activism And Judicial Restraint: Post-Emergency Era	424
<b>7.6</b>	Limits Of Judicial Review	428
<b>7.7</b>	Self Imposed Limitation On The Exercise Of The Power Of Judicial Review	432
<b>7.8</b>	Judicial Self Restraint	434

**CHAPTER VIII** **439**

**FUNCTIONING OF THE DOCTRINE  
OF JUDICIAL REVIEW IN INDIA AND U.S.A.-  
A COMPARATIVE CRITICAL ASSESSMENT** **440-498**

<b>8.1</b>	Judicial Review of Legislation: A Comparative Study of U.S.A. and India	443
<b>8.1.1.</b>	Federal System	444
<b>8.1.2.</b>	Reviewing the constitutionality of presidential action	446
<b>8.1.3.</b>	Due Process of law	448
<b>8.1.4.</b>	Socio-economic legislation	454
<b>8.1.5.</b>	Equal protection of law	458
<b>8.1.6.</b>	Judicial review of essential features of the basic	462

structure	
8.1.7. Powers of Supreme court	464
8.1.8. Laws protected under certain Articles of the Constitution cannot be challenged	465
8.1.9. Certain provisions of the constitution preclude the court from making judicial review	466
8.1.10. Judicial review of exclusionary clauses in statutes	468
8.1.11. Political equality	469
8.1.12. Commerce clause	471
8.2 Comparative Study of the judicial control of subordinate legislation and administrative action	473
8.3 Comparative study of unconstitutionality of legislation, and its cure: India and U.S.A.	476
8.4 Judicial Review with Of Constitutional Amendments In U.S.A.	479
8.4.1 Amending Provisions in the United States of America.	479
8.4.2 Attempt by the U.S. Supreme Court to exercise its Judicial Review power over Constitutional Amendment	482
<b><u>CHAPTER IX</u></b>	<b>487</b>
<b>CONCLUSIONS AND SUGGESTIONS</b>	<b>488-558</b>
9.1 Judicial Review Establishes The Concept Of Constitutional Supremacy	492
9.2 Supremacy Of The Constitution Leads To The Concept Of Judicial Review	494
9.3 Parliamentary Sovereignty And Judicial Review	495

9.3.1.	Pandit Nehru claimed Supremacy of Parliament	495
9.3.2.	The seeds of the Theory of Implied Limitations	496
9.3.3.	Glaring Conflict Between Parliament And the Supreme Court	497
9.3.4.	Concept of Sovereignty: Its Origin and Development	499
9.3.5.	Sovereignty is no longer indivisible or illimitable	500
9.3.6.	Two divergent approaches towards Supremacy of Parliament	503
9.3.7.	Supremacy of Parliament claimed on the ground of Representation of people	504
9.3.8.	Attempt to assert Supremacy of Parliament by the Forty Second Amendments, 1976	510
<b>9.4</b>	<b>Fundamental Objectives Of Judicial Review</b>	<b>514</b>
<b>9.5.</b>	<b>Modern Trends Of Judicial Review In India</b>	<b>515</b>
<b>9.6</b>	<b>Judicial Review: Need Of The Hour</b>	<b>518</b>
<b>9.7</b>	<b>Judicial Review: Justification</b>	<b>522</b>
9.7.1.	It maintains the system of check and balances	522
9.7.2.	Doctrine of Judicial Review as limitation on the democratic government	523
9.7.3.	Doctrine of Judicial review is the pre-requisite for the Federal system of Government	524
<b>9.8</b>	<b>Justification For Judicial Review Of Constitutional Amendments</b>	<b>524</b>
<b>9.9</b>	<b>Decisions of U.S. Supreme Court Nullified by the Constitutional Amendments-Judicial Review of Such Amendments Not possible In U.S.A. But Possible In India</b>	<b>527</b>

<b>9.10</b>	Judicial Review: Pre-requisites	530
9.10.1	Popular Sovereignty and Constitutional Supremacy	530
9.10.2	Federalism	531
9.10.3	Fundamental Rights	531
9.10.4	Delegation of Essential Legislative Power	532
9.10.5	Other Constitutional Restrictions and Prohibitions	532
9.10.6	Violation of the Principle of Natural Justice	532
9.10.7	Constitutional Amendments in Violation of the Constitution	533
<b>9.11</b>	Dangers Of Democracy And Creative Functions Of Judicial Review	533
<b>9.12</b>	Creative Role Of Judicial Review	534
<b>9.13</b>	Enlargement Of The Scope Of Judicial Review In The Case Of Non –Guaranteed Fundamental Rights	535
<b>9.14</b>	Supreme Court in process of re-writing the Constitution	535
<b>9.15</b>	Judiciary Is The Guardian Of The Constitution And Not The Third Chamber	537
<b>9.16</b>	Ill Effects Of Judicial Review	538
<b>9.17</b>	Judicial Review And Judicial Restraint	539
<b>9.18</b>	Unconstitutionality And Judicial Self-restraint	540
<b>9.19</b>	Suggestions	547
<b>9.20</b>	Judicial Review: Rules Of Conduct	547
9.20.1	Necessity of Establishing Well-defined Rules of Conduct	547
9.20.2	Suo moto action by Court	548
9.20.3	Individualism and Judicial Review	549

<b>9.21</b>	Judicial review, Judicial Activism and Policy-Making	550
<b>9.22</b>	Judicial review of constitutional amendments leads to the judicial supremacy	551
<b>9.23</b>	Concluding Suggestions	553