

Chapter 2

REVIEW OF LITERATURE

The introduction to the theme, conceptual framework, rationale of the study, objectives and hypotheses have been covered in Chapter 1. The present chapter is devoted to the review of related research.

Because of the interdisciplinary nature of the study encompassing communication, value education and gender sensitisation, the literature reviewed was diversified in its content and format.

The studies reviewed are grouped under two major categories: (i) Gender and Communication, and (ii) Value Education.

2.1 GENDER AND COMMUNICATION

Studies related to gender and communication encompass a very wide range with widely different concerns, methodology and populations. There is an abundance of studies and surveys describing the present scenario vis-a-vis gender bias and low status of women in different fields. The present review, however, is limited to only those studies that include an aspect of communication/educational intervention or are relevant from the point of view of research design and methodology.

Short (1993)'s study "Sex-typed Behaviour in the Primary School : the Significance of Contrasting Explanations" was concerned with explanations of sex-typed behaviour in primary school children. The first was in terms of social pressures to conform to the norms of society. The second focused on children's intellectual commitment to the 'truth' of gender stereotypes, whilst the third was an amalgam of the first two.

To explore children's beliefs about the validity of gender stereotypes, three moral dilemmas were presented to 161 six- to 11-year olds. Each dilemma involved an act of discrimination based on a gender stereotype. The children were required to say whether they thought the discriminatory act was fair and to give reasons for their answer.

The study observed that judging by the prevalence of sex-typed behaviour amongst primary-aged children, it would seem that many of them lack the courage of their convictions; they actively participate in discriminatory sexist behaviour, despite their beliefs. The study pointed out the need for anti-sexist interventions to acknowledge that a purely cognitive approach to the prevention of gender-based discrimination, whilst necessary for its elimination, is not sufficient. Some children, at least, will also need help in resisting those social pressures that can lead to unfair discrimination. Yet the means of teaching children to withstand these pressures would seem to be an issue that has so far escaped the attention of

educationists and others concerned with advancing social justice.

Keefer (1994) in a study entitled "Gilligan's Moral Orientation and Deliberation" focussed on the psychology of moral reasoning and in particular on Carol Gilligan's gender-based claim that there are two different orientation to the construal and resolution of moral problems.

The purpose of the research was to advance and test an alternative to Gilligan's gender-based theory of moral reasoning. The proposal offered was that moral reasoning involves the application of a set of norms or rules containing "all things being equal" clauses. If these conditions are assumed to be met the rule or norm excludes considerations of other concerns.

Gender differences were examined in two studies using hypothetical dilemmas. Findings contradicted Gilligan's claim that gender differences are to be found in the form of reasoning; rather, they suggested that while the genders differed in their judgements as to which rules or norms may be treated as exclusionary, once adopted, rules and norms are applied in similar ways. The study argued that Gilligan's contribution to moral theory is not simply that women be include in the moral theory, but that the moral theory itself must include the strategy of reasoning that she found to characterise women's responses to moral conflicts.

Kolia (1994)'s study of gender training programs used internationally with a focus on African experience aimed to further develop the knowledge base of the field by providing a quantitative analysis of 36 programs (and their supporting materials) and to describe the state of the art of gender training program on an international scale. In addition two detailed case studies of gender training program in African region were presented and analyzed.

Gender training programs have emerged as important tools to be used in the process of gender sensitisation and gender responsiveness in international development and policy. The study documented several interesting findings some of which were : (1) Gender training is taking place in many parts of the world, within various institutions; (2) Equity and efficiency are parallel themes underlying most training programs; (3) History, tradition and culture play an important role in the oppression of women in the region and are very significant obstacles to the advancement of women in Africa; (4) Collaboration and networking are the keys to progress in the field; (5) Starting with a policy commitment for gender responsiveness from people in power is a useful but not sufficient basis for change; (6) Third World women are active creators of change, but there is a need to develop a critical mass of gender-responsive people in any society; (7) An integrated interactive approach to policy and planning appears to yield a better result as opposed to a linear one; (8) Although the

objectives of gender sensitivity and empowerment are being achieved by most training efforts, there is still much work to be done regarding the implementation of the training or the skills learned from it.

The study recommended gender responsive training as an alternative tool to address gender biases.

Gender Balancing the Curriculum : "Attitudes, Knowledge of Feminist Issues and Self-Efficacy of Female Under-Graduates" was the title of a study by Mulvihill (1994) which tested whether it would be feasible to improve attitudes towards women, knowledge of Feminist Issues and Self-Efficacy by gender balancing the curriculum and including same sex role models in the management classes of an undergraduate business school. Subjects participated in an experiment which took place over the course of a college semester. The experiment consisted of a pretest, posttest and a gender balanced management curriculum.

Subjects in the study were 86 female undergraduates in eight management classes. Four of the classes were randomly assigned to the experimental treatment and four to the control treatment. Two classes in each group had female professors and two had male professors. The curriculum was gender balanced by incorporating in the program readings and case studies which highlighted women in business in positions of power and authority with decision-making responsibilities, by having female role-models as teachers

and guest speakers and through the use of highlighting women with successful business careers

Results of the statistical analysis revealed that attitudes toward women and self-efficacy among female students could be improved significantly by gender balancing the curriculum and including female role models. However, the study failed to support the hypothesis that knowledge of feminist issues could be improved by such modification but indicated that the consciousness was raised in the area.

Thirty-two four-to-five year olds were randomly assigned to one of eight play groups (four treatment, four control). They were individually questioned concerning adult occupations on four separate occasions (week 2, 3, 4 and 14). At times 3 and 4, prior to measuring, children in the treatment condition were read non-traditional books while those in control condition were read traditional books.

control group, would become less gender stereotypical about adult occupations over time. In addition, this research did not find that boys were more stereotypical than girls. Children were more stereotypical about boys being nurses than about girls being doctors. In general, children's role play was stereotypical regardless of their gender stereotyped attitudes. That is, some children whose beliefs were high on gender stereotyping played non-traditional roles and vice-versa. Finally boys were less willing to take on gender non-traditional roles during play than were girls.

The goal of the study entitled "Gender Equity and Schools: Theory and Practice" by Engelberg (1995) was to integrate theoretical writing of modern feminism, critical theory and post-modernism with empirical findings. The study begins with a theoretical analysis of the debate between advocates of critical theory, post-modernism, and feminism. Critical theory tends toward abstraction in its search for utopian ideals of justice, truth, liberation, dialogue and political transformation. Post-modernism rejects "master" narratives and universalising and seeks local and partial truths which reveal the power of patriarchy in the control of knowledge and science. Post-modernism also searches for local centres of resistance but includes the decentered self and the death of theory, which most feminists reject. Feminists are divided : some support critical theory, some support post-modernism and some see merit in both critical theory belief in transformation and

the post-modernist belief in challenging the accepted tenets of science, identity and universal truths.

The empirical methods used were qualitative and quantitative observations of 43 classes in a high school. Two surveys about classroom attitudes were conducted : a survey of three senior psychology classes and a survey of ninth and twelfth grade students in a variety of subjects. The results often contradicted the claim of the American Association of University Women's report that girls were short-changed. Girls and boys were sometimes short-changed by tracking or other classroom practices. Class participation does not always reflect achievement. The conclusion suggested that in line with critical feminist theory, schools must find ways of transforming education and social attitudes to make them more equitable.

2.2 VALUE EDUCATION

A sizeable number of studies have been conducted in the area of Value Education. A greater number of earlier studies are conducted abroad but during the eighties and later several Indian studies have also been conducted. The review includes only those studies which were conducted with adolescents - secondary school students and undergraduates. Studies which had relevance from the methodological point of view are also reviewed.

Kaufman (1974) compared the effectiveness of (i) group career counseling (a credit class) that employed a

combination of value clarification, decision making, and career exploration activities, (ii) one-to-one career counseling and (iii) no intervention. The study was conducted with undergraduate junior and senior women and it found that both experimental groups did significantly better than the control group and the value clarification group produced significantly better results than the one-to-one counseling with respect to self-knowledge, knowledge of self in relation to career and planning activities in seeking career information.

Pracejus (1975) conducted an experiment with two groups of eighth graders. One group participated in twelve sessions of discussing stories using a value clarification approach while the other group read the same stories and followed the discussion approach suggested by the publisher. Gains in reading comprehension were compared and the value clarification group was found to have significantly higher reading comprehension compared to the other group.

Rutowski (1975) studied the effect of value clarification, strategies and 'value level' treatment of subject matter on attitude towards science. High school chemistry students formed the sample and were used as their own controls. An attitude test was administered four times before beginning the experimental treatment and four times during it. The increase reached statistical significance on the last attitude test administered. The study concluded

that the value clarification strategies and value level treatment of subject matter had a positive effect on students attitude towards science.

Blokker, Glaser and Kirschenbaum (1976) conducted a study titled 'All About Me' using value clarification approach. 250 boys and 250 girls participated in the study. The treatment was administered for five weeks at the rate of one hour per day. It was found that decision making ability improved and the treatment was helpful in their personal control over their own lives.

Morton (1976) conducted a study which used moral dilemmas for the development of moral reasoning. The experiment was carried out with three groups of high school juniors. Each group consisted of 15 students. Experimental Group I participated in discussion of moral dilemmas and also experienced value clarification interventions. Experimental Group II participated only in dilemma discussion session while the Control group was engaged in its normal activities. The study found that the experimental curriculum had a significant effect on overall moral reasoning development.

Hobster (1980) conducted a study to determine the effectiveness of value clarification group activities on the development of student values and value system in young adolescents. Four groups comprising of fifteen boys and fifteen girls experienced five value clarification

activities. The study observed positive change in the structure of the value system of adolescents. The experience level of the facilitator and the sex of students were important variables in influencing the change.

Makenzie (1980) studied the effect of value clarification interventions with moral dilemmas on moral reasoning of high school children. No change was found in moral reasoning in case of substantial majority of students.

Patric (1985) conducted an experiment to investigate the effectiveness of value clarification activities on the terminal and instrumental values of eighth grade students. The students were randomly assigned to two experimental groups and two control groups. The findings indicated that experimental groups differed significantly from the control group. The study concluded that value clarification approach was useful to students in clarifying their terminal and instrumental values.

Singh and Singh (1989) conducted an experiment entitled "Effectiveness of value clarifying strategies in Value Orientation of B.Ed. students". The sample comprised of 113 students from four different colleges in four different cities. The experimental group had 50 students while the control group had 63 students. Five values - cooperation, dedication to teaching profession, nationalism, scientific outlook and perseverance - were assessed using the Value Orientation Test Battery. It was found that the

value clarification approach group was significantly superior compared to the conventional method group with respect to dedication, co-operation, nationalism and scientific outlook.

Singh (1987) conducted an experimental study on "Comparison of Value Discussion Model with Conventional Approach in Terms of Value Clarification of B.Ed. students". The sample consisted of 40 female B.Ed. student-teachers divided equally between control and experimental groups. The study adopted multiple quasi experimental design and used Value Orientation Test Battery to assess value orientation. Values assessed under the study were co-operation, dedication to teaching profession, nationalism, scientific outlook and perseverance. The Value Discussion Model was found effective in terms of dedication to teaching profession and perseverance when measured immediately at the end of the treatment when both the groups were matched with respect to intelligence.

Singh (1991) studied comparative effectiveness of Value Discussion Model with traditional approach for developing value clarification of college students. The experiment was conducted at two stages - tryout and field. At the tryout stage the sample was 233 college-going men and women while at field stage the sample size was 127 - 63 for the experimental group and 64 for the control group. Dilemmas and discussion were the major components of the model used as a treatment. Data were collected by using

Value Clarification Test and Value Judgement Test. Results showed that Value Discussion Model was effective in developing Value Clarification ability of the students and the change in Value Judgement of students treated with Value Discussion Model was significant.

King (1994) conducted a study entitled "Teaching for Thinking and Citizenship Education : Examining the Constitution of Student - citizens in Secondary Social Studies".

Informed by post-structural and critical educational theory, King's dissertation examines the emphasis given to the teaching of thinking and its association with a socially transformative citizenship in twelve Social Studies classes in four U.S. Secondary Schools. The focus of transformative citizenship is a concern for reconstructing society by developing a critical understanding of and engagement with social issues and institutions. Orienting this understanding and engagement are concerns for overcoming relations of domination and promoting a more just and equitable distribution of society's needs.

The study revealed that for many teachers teaching for thinking and citizenship primarily involved the transmission of knowledge. Even teachers who embraced a multicultural perspective tended to equate it with simply adding content about diverse, under-represented groups to an already inflated curriculum.

The most thoughtful treatment of civic related content, however, was more closely associated with a socially progressive commitment on part of students and this commitment cut across gender and racial or ethnic lines.

The two trends evident in these classes - critiquing conditions of racial oppressions and connecting personally relevant concerns of students to public issues, appeared to have altered the regulative discourse of the classroom, thereby opening up possibilities for a more transformative citizenship.

From the Review of Literature it is seen that value-education/value-development studies have not paid attention to gender-equality as a value. Also, programs on gender-sensitisation are on increase in India, but no systematic research as yet has been taken up to evaluate the impact of these programs and effectiveness of various communication strategies adopted in these programs.