# Introduction

The beginning of British rule in India and the Christian missionaries that followed in their wake paved the way for the emergence of print culture and culture of translation in India. These new cultures had a profound effect on the Indian culture. Print culture and translation became a medium for some of the important changes that took place in the Indian cultures politically, socially and in the literary. I am studying the two cultures, print and translation, and the changes that arose because of them in the context of Christianity in early colonial Gujarat. The conversion of the religion due to the introduction of print culture and translation changes colonial Gujarat socially, culturally. The inequality of castes led to the Dalits in Gujarat adopting Christianity from the 19<sup>th</sup> century onwards. The role of printed material and translations in this process was very important. The Christian gospels introduced them to the concept of liberation which allowed them to think about their own position in society. The Christian gospels and the preaching of the early priests as well as the translation and the printed version of the Bible enlightened them towards the understanding of Christian concepts. The importance of this study, according to me is to show how the early print culture and translation helped to locate the big question of caste in the early history of Dalit Christians in the 19<sup>th</sup> and early 20<sup>th</sup> centuries. In my research I have studied the printed materials of Christianity which were the first hand, most

important source of diffusion of Christianity in colonial India and Gujarat. Some key words which are very important for my thesis are public sphere, print culture, colonialism, culture of translation and conversion.

According to P. Sanal Mohan the term modernity refers to "the socioeconomic and intellectual transformation that western world has undergone" (Mohan, 8). And those transformation day by day become so universal that today it is possible to speak of modernity in

non-European societies that have undergone colonial experience referred to as colonial modernity. Colonial modernity proposes that non-European societies had experienced the cultural and social transformation that European societies had undergone (Mohan, 8). My thesis uses this insight to describe the Christianity in colonial India and Gujarat and the transformation of the early converts in nineteenth century Gujarat. I also intend to analyse the negotiations of the lower caste with the new sociocultural forces that developed under colonial modernity by looking the emergence of print culture and culture of translation in colonial Gujarat.

Mohan says "Modernity goes along with the formation of the nation state and the establishment of the hegemony of the dominant social groups (Mohan, 9)". In this sense, modernity means the creation of a new dominant social group who creates the nation state. This is also related in certain ways to the emergence of the new cultural forms that are best represented in new literary genre (Mohan, 9).

According to Mohan, in colonial societies the availability and the use of modern language is symptomatic of modernity (Mohan, 9). The emergence of new religion and new cultures are also a consequence of this modernity. The introduction of literacy and letters is an aspect of colonial modernity. In the very early nineteenth century it is true that the literacy was limited to those who joined the missions, and read the scriptures and religious tracts but afterwards it is observed that literacy could never be subjected to a limited function (Mohan, 9). I propose to study the role that missionaries played in engendering the emergence of two cultures, print culture and culture of translation as a means with which to spread Christianity in Gujarat. I will further analyse the effect these two cultures have on the question of caste within the fold of Christianity.

Modernity has paved the way for the creation of interactive space in many ways that were unbelievable to the pre-moderns (Mohan, 9). It creates the new human beings out of the control of bodily practices which is very necessary in colonial situation. The different examples of modernity are useful for us to understand the experience of the early converts in colonial India. To give a precise account of the connection between colonialism and Christianity in India, we need to ask certain questions on the issues such as

Did Colonialism create and support Christianity and its mission's activities?

Did Christianity support Colonialism?

Did Christianity and its mission prepare the way for Colonialism?

Did Christianity identify with the source of Colonialism?

These are the areas which can be helpful to take the discussion further.

## **Literature Review**

The European empire in India started at the end of 15<sup>th</sup> century when Vasco Da Gama discovered a sea route to India and landed at the port of Calicut in 1498. Following his arrival many European powers like Portugal, France, Holland, Denmark and Britain also began their forays into India. On the other hand, Christianity emerged in India in first century CE but it came to be well established at the end of the nineteenth century. Christianity and Colonization both introduce many developments and changes in India.

Christians form the third largest religious community in India (Neil, xi). As Sue Penney gives suggests in her book *Christianity: Discovering Religions*, Christianity is the religion of people who are Christians. The followers of this religion derive their belief in God based on the teaching of the book The Holy Bible (Penney, 3). Jesus Christ is the central figure in this book and is considered as the saviour so the word Christianity was derived after him. Christianity was spreading very fast.

Robert Eric Frykenberg in his edited book *Christians and Missionaries in India: Cross Cultural Communication since 1500* says the word "Christian" is a term of diminishment. Further he says "It is subject to something else and is subordinated to it. Things "Christian"- Christian missions, Christian individuals, Christian institution, or Christian activities - pertain to things concerned with or defined by faith in a person and in the gospel delivered to his followers" (Frykenberg 5).

The word dual identity refers Christians connected with both, belief and to the relationship with the person at the centre of that belief, Jesus Christ. Belief refers to the command of Jesus. The followers are commanded to spread the good news of faith which is a gift of God itself. This faith is that God creates all human being. All human beings are a replica of God. God sacrificed his life for them only and he himself gives the power to spread this faith and enable everyone to connect with the ultimate God. This faith is at the core of the meaning of Christian. And so according to Frykenberg, Christianity is a basic theological and historical term which has "Consisted of individualized and institutionalized expression of such belief" (Frykenberg 5).

In *Colonialism: A Primary Source Analysis* Philip Wolny discusses that "Colonialism" comes from the word 'colony'. A colony is a group of people living in a territory under the rule of a parent state (np). In Wolny's opinion a colony develops in a place where indigenous people have lived for generations with their own established culture and traditions (np). According to him the age of exploration brought the European powers to many places which are strange to them. And eventually they tried to merge their government and ruled over them and be powerful. People living under the foreign rule often struggle to maintain their own traditions and culture. By eighteenth century British established control over India (Wolny, np).

The missionaries who came very early to India had varied experiences. Camil Parkhe in his book *Contribution of Christian Missionaries in India* discusses about the different missionaries' struggle and experience while introducing the new religion to the people who already follow a religion of their own. He refers to the untouchables who were the members of the lowest social caste and who lived in ghettos far away from the colonies of the higher caste. The high caste could not even think of having normal relationship with European missionaries. The early missionaries were called *firangis*. (Parkhe 8). People who kept contact with this Europeans had the risk of excommunication from their respective communities.

When Fr Robert De Nobili came to Madurai, he felt like a stranger to others because they thought of him as a *firangi*. The same experience faced by other missionaries who came before him but no one could change the situation. Fr Nobili tried to understand the reason for this behaviour and started adapting. He changed his own lifestyle and dressing traditions rather than attempting to change the upper caste Hindu tradition. The first thing he did was to give up consumption of flesh and following the prevalent tradition among the Christian priests, he took to wearing the black cassock (Parkhe, 34). Later, he started using saffron coloured cloths and wooden sandals, like Hindu hermits. He tonsured his head and started applying sandalwood paste on his forehead (Parkhe, 34). He started moving about with a wooden staff in his right hand and a small kamandalu (water bowl) (Parkhe, 34). He was the first Christian missionaries who changed so much. It was a revolutionary change in the history of the church according to Parkhe. All these efforts were for rendering himself familiar to the local population. He had to face a long battle with his fellow Jesuits and the hierarchy in the Catholic church to bring about this change and make it acceptable. When he adorned the costume of a hermit and gave up non vegetarian food this foreign seer was slowly accepted by the locals as their guru (Parkhe, 34).

Fr Nobili understood that the main reason behind the closed doors of the country for the European missionaries before him was this European pride in their own culture and contempt for the local culture as Parkhe said (Parkhe, 34). So he preferred to blend with the local traditions before preaching Christianity among the local population (Parkhe, 34). Because of this for the first time in the sixteenth century as Parkhe said the gates of India were opened for Christianity. Fr Nobili preached Christianity mainly among the Brahmins and other caste people (Parkhe, 36). At that time any local person who accepts Christianity were immediately identified as *firangi* and excommunicated by society. The Brahmins who were at the top status in religious, social and other matters and no one risked to go against them so Fr Nobili stopped to conversion of these people (Parkhe, 36). However, some scholars have accused De Nobili of favouring the high caste rich people than the poor and untouchables as Parkhe said. The low caste and the untouchables of the society would not dare unless and until the high caste people embraced this religion (Parkhe, 37). St. Francis Xavier and other missionaries arrived in India before Fr De Nobili but only he could make difference and preach among the higher caste Brahmins. Though this struggle and difficulties Parkhe says that while carrying out his missionary work some of his own religious colleagues accused him of restricting his apostolic mission to high class Brahmins and introducing racism and casteism into Christianity (Parkhe, 39). At last Fr De Nobili banned from propagating Christianity among the Brahmins (Parkhe, 39). Now let's moved to the history of Christianity in Gujarat which is the main concern of the study.

Robin Boyd, an Irish Presbyterian historian, opens his book *History of the Church in Gujarat* with an account of Jourdain, a French missionary preaches, first in Thana, Mumbai and later at Bharuch in the fourteenth century. With the arrival of the Portuguese in 1498, India faced the vast changes culturally politically, and socially. During 1500-1515, the Portuguese governor

Albuquerque won wide ranging victories across India. Goa was most important of these. It became the centre for their rule in India. Portuguese entered in India for business as well as for spreading Christianity in India (Boyd 5). At that time Portuguese government used a range of strategies to spread Christianity (Boyd 5). They destroyed temples and mosques. They only allowed Christians to worship openly (Boyd 6). In 1537 the Portuguese entered in Gujarat by defeating the Sultan of Gujarat. On 22 September 1570 the Portuguese rulers announced that Hindus who become Christians should be exempted from land-tax for fifteen years (Neil 225). Enslaved Hindus who became Christians were to be set free. The law of inheritance also changed. The widows and daughters of Hindus who accepted Christianity could claim their inheritance (Neil 225). A significant decree of 1562 states

That any Hindu wife who becomes a Christian, and who does not wish to live with her husband and separates from him on the ground that he continues to live as an unbeliever, shall have a right to all the ornaments and personal clothes which are in her possession at the time of her conversion, as well as one half of her husband's estate, movable or immovable, acquired after the date of her Marriage (Neil, 225).

In 1559 various pieces of legislation were codified by the court and the code now included the following regulations:

All existing images are to be destroyed and no new ones are to be made.

No Hindu feasts are to be celebrated in public.

Hindu preachers and teachers are forbidden access to the island of Goa.

The Holi festival is banned.

*Sati*, the burning of Hindu widows is forbidden. If the presence of images is suspected, the chief justice is to be informed. If the charge is proved, the guilty party

is to be condemned to the galleys for life, half of his property to go to the informer and half to the church (Neil 226).

Another announcement on 23<sup>rd</sup> March 1559 orders that Hindu infants left without near families and are not of an age are to be handed over to the Fathers of the College of St Paul to be baptized, educated and indoctrinated by the Fathers and are to be placed by them in positions according to their respective aptitudes and abilities (Neil, 225). Stephen Neil in his book *A History of Christianity in India*, Volume 1 also refers to a letter of Peter de Almeida SJ written from Goa on 26 December 1558, in which he describes various raids on Hindu houses.

The seventeenth century saw a considerable increase in the number of missions at work in India including Carmelites, Oratorians, Theatines and Capuchins. They joined the Franciscans, Dominicans and Augustinians who had arrived in the sixteenth century. The Franciscans were first in the field, and for a time were the only missionaries working among non-Christians in India. Their headquarters, like those of other orders, were in Goa, with Cochin as second in importance. But by 1585 they had convents in nine places - Cochin, Cannanore, two in Goa, Chaul, Thana, Bassein and Daman, and, on the Coromandel Coast, S. Thome and Nagapattinam. All these places were in Portuguese territory or under Portuguese influence. Increasingly the Franciscans came to concentrate their work on the instruction and care of those who were already Christians, or were coming forward for baptism (Neil249). By 1585 there were already seven organized parishes, each with its own church and parish priest. By 1595 the number increased to eleven (Neil 249). In 1587 the number of Christians under the care of the Franciscans amounted to 40,000. Seven thousand of these were in the island of Bardes, 2,000 in Bassein and Agashi. The brothers in Cannanore had baptized 10,000, and Br Antony Porto had himself baptized 10,156 persons (Neil 249). Thirty nuns resided in the convent at Cochin and fifteen in Cannanore. No other religious body was so well represented at Cannanore. As Neil states

In view of the inveterate tendency of missionaries to inflate their statistics these figures must be regarded with a good deal of suspicion. No indication is given in the sources as to the castes to which the converts belonged; but in view of the statement of Robert Nobili in 1610 that in these regions no one of distinction and no member of the higher castes had been baptized, it must be taken as probable that they were drawn from the less prosperous communities (Neil 249).

In the discussion of the history of Christianity in Gujarat Armenians has very important role because they are the first who introduced Christianity to Gujarat systematically for the first time. The Christian religion of Armenians was the mixture of Portuguese Roman Catholic religion and the Protestant religion of Dutch and British (Boyd, 10). The protestant missionary C. C. Aratoon was from Armenia.

In the sixteenth century the British entered India. In 1600 the East India Company entered Surat, the portal of India. All the business of India was done from the port of Surat. In 1612 the English got permission of doing business in Surat, Khambhat, Ahmadabad, and Ghogha. British businessmen followed their own religion like the Armenians but they did not force other people to convert to their religion. However, they did begin proselytizing activities on a small scall by the seventeenth century. (Boyd 14).

The next Christian missionary who came to Surat was Roman Catholic. In 1640 the French Kapuchin religious priest started missionary work. Priest Zenon Baug and his two friends has started the preaching work (Boyd 5). In 1654 they built churches in Surat. Till 1651, Priest Zenon Baug preached in Surat; he was later followed by Priest Ane Ambrose.

The eighteenth century was a low point for Christianity in India. Many questions and negative issues made the colonial native suspicious of the religion. At this point a large group of youngsters under the enlightened guidance of John Wesley worked for the renaissance of Christianity (Boyd 21). With the arrival of this enlightened group, a new meaning of conversion emerged. By the end of eighteenth century, a number of missionary societies were established including Baptist Missionary Society (1792), London Missionary Society (1795), and Church Missionary Society (1799).

The Anglican Church did not have a proper centre in India till the nineteenth century. Finally, in 1814 Thomas Fanshawe Middleton was appointed as bishop of Church of England. In 1833 East India Company created two dioceses, Mumbai and Madras. Thomas Carr was appointed as the first Bishop of the Bombay Diocese. Carr obtained equal rights for converts in 1850.

In the history of Christianity in Gujarat the most important event was when a huge wave of conversion to Christianity took place during the famine of 1899-1900 in Gujarat. In this period the missionaries came forward to aid people. The missionary compounds were full of the rescued people, especially children. In 1899, J. S. Stevens opened an orphanage house. In 1900 cholera gripped the area. Missionaries pressed forward in the service of the sick. As a consequence, after 1900, many conversions took place. It is against this backdrop that I propose to situate my study of print culture and the culture of translation.

#### **Objectives**:

Focusing on colonial modernity, public sphere and the question of inequality in castes in Gujarat, I intend to study the role played by Christian print and translation cultures in the constitution of the Christian public sphere in colonial Gujarat. In this context, some of the questions I investigate are the following:

- i. How did the introduction of print affect textual culture of Gujarat in the nineteenth century? What was the nature of public sphere engendered by the emergence of print culture in colonial Gujarat?
- ii. What was the role played by Christian missionaries in the introduction of print culture in Gujarat?
- iii. What was the nature of translation that developed out of the proselytizing efforts of Christian missionaries in Gujarat?
- iv. What were the new forms of writing that emerged as a consequence of the emergence of print culture and the culture of translation?
- v. How did these new forms of writing address the question of liberation and salvation and in what manner did it affect the articulation of 'lower caste' identity?

My hypothesis is that early printed religious books set up a new language of faith that played an important role in the construction of a new public comprising of early converts. The printing of the Christian material and more importantly the translation of such materials resulted in the growth of the new religion, Christianity, in the area where other religions pre-existed. Further, I propose that these texts also had an impact upon the development of modern Gujarati through the introduction of new genres and vocabularies.

### Methodology

My research topic focuses on Christianity in early colonial Gujarat in the light of the influence of the print culture and the culture of translation. The study will draw from many theoretical sources to understand the role of print culture and the culture of translation in the public sphere on one hand and on new forms of writing on the other. Some of the theoretical areas will include the following:

- 1. Theories of the public sphere: To understand the construction of the public sphere as well as the literary public sphere. I will draw in particular on the work of Jurgen Habermas who defines the role of the public sphere as "the way for the civil society to articulate their own interest and for the self-interpretation developed through the public opinion" (Habermas 29). Habermas also discusses the literary public sphere which plays a very important role in the development of any individual person (Habermas 28). I have referred Jurgen Habermas', *The Structural Transformation of the Public Sphere: An Inquiry into a Category of Bourgeois Society*. I have specially focused on Nancy Fraser's "Rethinking the Public Sphere: A Contribution to the Critique of actually existing democracy", Veena Naregal's *Language, Politics, Elites, and the Public Sphere: Western Indian under Colonialism,* and Charu Gupta's *Sexuality, Obscenity and Community: Women, Muslims and the Hindu Public in Colonial India* to help me develop a more nuanced understanding of the public sphere.
- 2. Theories of Translation: To help me analyze translated hymn books, tracts and scriptures translated from English into Gujarati. I have specifically drawn on Eugene Nida's *The Theory and Practice of Translation* and Susan Bassnett's *Translation Studies* to help me understand the processes of translation so that I can analyse the translated works chosen for study. Nida's dynamic-equivalence approach to Bible translation was particularly relevant to my study.

- 3. Theories of colonial discourse: To understand how the discourses of colonial modernity came to shape and be shaped by print culture put in place by colonial Christianity. Sanal Mohan's book *Modernity of Slavery: Struggles against Caste Inequality in Colonial Kerala* would prove to be useful as he discusses these issues in the context of Christianity in colonial Kerala.
- 4. Theories of Nation/Nationalism: To understand the importance of print culture in the construction of the imagined nation in colonial India. Apart from Benedict Anderson, I would draw on *Language, Politics, Elites and the Public Sphere* by Veena Naregal and *Sexuality, Obscenity and Community: Women, Muslims and the Hindu Public in Colonial India* by Charu Gupta to help me understand the relationship between print culture, public sphere and colonial context.

With these frameworks in mind, I propose to do close textual analyses of my primary material. Archival study, particularly of nineteenth century material on Gujarati Christianity, will also play an important role in my proposed research work

## Scope:

In this thesis, I study the early print culture and the culture of translation that Christianity introduced into colonial Gujarat. As I have discussed before, Christianity emerged in Gujarat in the fourteenth century but print culture, introduced by Christian missionaries in Gujarat, emerged in the nineteenth century, so my study would focus on nineteenth century Gujarat and the shaping of Christian print culture and the culture of translation. My study would also restrict itself to analysing and evaluating the new forms of writing engendered by cultures of print and translation. I will

restrict myself further to a study of English source texts that were translated into Gujarati in the colonial Gujarati Christian context. My study which proposes to discuss the history of print in the context of Gujarati Christianity would help open up the question of caste contexts.

## **Chapters:**

As I am trying to locate the 19th century Gujarat. I have studied the changes in the textual culture of Gujarat in the light of the emergence of the print culture and the culture of translation in the nineteenth century. Focusing on colonial modernity, public sphere and the question of inequality in castes in Gujarat, I have studied the role played by Christian print and translation cultures in the constitution of the Gujarati imagination. In this context in my first chapter, I have described the social formation of India, paying particular attention to Gujarat in the nineteenth century. I begin by discussing the colonialism and Christianity in India. I have given a detailed account of the relationship of Christian missionaries to the various colonial powers to which they were affiliated. I have shown how historians have looked the Christian missionaries in two ways, firstly, the missionaries are considered as saints and as exemplars of ideals for others and the secondly, they have been viewed as arrogant and rapacious imperialists who spread Christianity through any means in India.<sup>1</sup> I have drawn on Homi Bhabha's concept of mimicry as a theoretical tool to explain the dual identity if Indian converts. I have also drawn on his concept of hybridity as a useful explanatory category to analyse Indian Christians. The chapter further discusses Christianity in colonial Gujarat. I offer an account of the spread of Christianity in Gujarat and

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>1</sup> Andrews, Edward (2010). Christian Missions and Colonial Empires Reconsidered: A Black Evangelist in West Africa, 1766-1816 Journal of Church and state. 663-691.

examine some of its implications. I show how the establishment of the East India Company came to be a turning point for the presence of Christianity in Gujarat. I conclude the chapter with an account of caste in the context of Christianity in colonial Gujarat, showing the way strategies for conversion were altered on the basis of caste by missionaries.

In the second chapter I focus on the emergence of print culture which affected the textual culture of India as well as Gujarat in the nineteenth century. The chapter starts with the discussion of the history of printing press in India. With the historical discussion the chapter also gives an account of the emergence of print in colonial Gujarat. I discuss the views of Elizabeth L. Eisenstein to show how the new technique of printing introduced a shift from scribal to typographical culture and brought many developments in the world. I show that because of the introduction of print culture, the medium of knowledge giving changed. People could take knowledge from wherever they want. According to Eisenstein learning to read is different from learning in oral tradition. She says that in the age of scribes the dependence on oral communication and special 'mnemonic devices' changed after the mastering of the letters (Eisenstein 65-66). The chapter gives a very detailed historical description of the emergence of print culture colonial Gujarat. I have laid out the role played by missionaries in the invention of the Gujarati type and in the importation of printing presses. I have primarily relied on Avant Kakba Priolkar's The Printing Press in India: its Beginning and Early Development. With this background, chapter discusses the print in colonial Gujarat. From Bhimji Parekh to Farundaji whole history of printing and the discovery of Gujarati fonts discussed in third chapter. After this the chapter gives an account of Christian print culture in colonial Gujarat.

In the third chapter I have studied the role of culture of translation in colonial Christianity in Gujarat. The nature of translation that developed out of the proselytizing efforts of Christian missionaries in Gujarat. Here I have studied about the new forms of writing influenced by English and in what way did they affect the development of modern Gujarati literature. These new forms of writing address the question of liberation and salvation and it also affect the articulation of "lower caste' identity. The chapter opens with the view of Andreas J. Köstenberger and David A. Croteau in his Which Bible Translation Should I Use? on translation. The chapter initially focuses on Bible translation. The types of the Bible and the use of those Bibles is discussed in this chapter. I have drawn on Eugene Nida's Dynamic Equivalence translation theory, described in his work Theory and the Practice of Translation. I have also drawn on Susan Bassnett's proposition that at the centre of the many theories of translation articulated by non-European writers are three recurring tricks: a redefinition of the terminology of faithfulness and equivalence, the importance of highlighting the visibility of the translator and a shift of emphasis that views translation as an act of creative rewriting (Bassnett 6). Her validation of the polysystems theory was useful in the context of this chapter because it shifted the focus of the attention away from the debate about the faithfulness and equivalence towards an examination of the role of the translated text in its new context (Bassnett 7).

At the end the chapter, I discuss the translation of Christian material in colonial Gujarat focusing first on the translation of the Bible into Gujarati, and following this up with the translations of other tracts and genres Manaseh Bhurajibhai's *Matina Patro ma Daivy Khajano* [The Divine Treasure in the Mud Pot] proves a very important source for the historical information of Christian print culture in Gujarat. The chapter has very detailed account of the printed and translated material in Christian colonial Gujarat. In the final section I compare *Daud na Geeto* [*The Psalms of David*] by Valji Bechar with Rev. Glasgow's *The Psalms of David* (1856) to look at the strikingly different modes of translation. In addition, I will examine hymn books like *Kavyaarpan (1863), Subodh Garbavali (1938), Geetsastra*,() to show how the site of translation in the context of colonial Christianity in Gujarat was a deeply complex space. This section gives some examples of the hymn books to understand the role of print and translation in Christian public Sphere.

In the fourth chapter I have tried to study print culture, culture of translation and the construction of the Christian public sphere in colonial Gujarat. Nancy Fraser discusses Habermas concept of public sphere and adds her own views on it. Habermas in his work discusses about the bourgeois public sphere here Fraser argues that there never was and never should be, just one public sphere but rather a number of public spheres. This space is conceptually different from state (Fraser 519). This is arena where citizens criticize the state. I argue that the Christian church in modern time can be considered as different public sphere where Christians come together and discuss about their common interest. I suggest that the early printed and religious books set up a new language of faith that played an important role in the construction of a new public comprising of early converts. The printing of the Christian material and more importantly the translation of such materials resulted in the growth of the new religion, Christianity, in the area where other religions pre-existed. The printed tracts and books played a central role in the establishment of Christian public sphere in debates. These debates which took place in churches, and other places organized on the basis of a Christian moral framework. My analysis of key texts show how caste is written into print and mediates translation. I have argued, consequently, that the Christian public sphere in colonial Gujarat is marked by caste and community, and is thus structured in a hyphenated and hybrid mode.

The fifth chapter concludes the dissertation and pulls together the arguments made in the previous chapters in a comparative perspective. It loops back to question of caste and the role of

print culture and culture of translation in colonial Christianity in Gujarat. In this chapter I have sum up all the discussions of Habermas, Homi Bhabha, Eugine Nida, etc theoretical frame works which I used to understand the role of print culture and the culture of translation in Christian pubic sphere. The key findings, some limitations which I have in my study some future scopes which I can see in the study of this kind of archival material. The study of different archival material to study of the objectives which I have behind this research. This chapter discussed the very important source for my study P. Sanal Mohan's *Modernity of Slavery: Struggle against Caste Inequality in Colonial Kerala*.