

भव एव भवाजिनति मे नितरां
समजायत चेतसि कौतुकिता ।
मम वारय मोहमहाजलधिं
भव शङ्कर देशिक मे शरणम् ॥
तोटकाष्टकम् - ०४॥

CHAPTER 04

**Sarva-siddhānta-saṅgraha & Sarva-darśana-saṅgraha
and the atheist (*Nāstika*) as well as the theist (*Āstika*)
systems of philosophy**

(pp. 155 - 187)

Chapter 04

Sarva-siddhānta-saṅgraha & Sarva-darśana-saṅgraha and the atheist (*Nāstika*) as well as the theist (*Āstika*) systems of philosophy

Any system of religious philosophy advocated or propagated and furthered by the respective followers, establishes its principles under 03 main topics *viz.* Soul (जीवः), World (जगत्) and the God (ईश्वरः or welknown as जगदीश). These three topics are so much developed in contents and structure that each of the common followers find satisfaction of completeness and hence no chance is left for any other system to be adopted, perhaps out of staunchness.

Here below a brief comparative study of the Sarva-siddhānta-saṅgraha and the Sarva-darśana-saṅgraha is given followed by the presentation of atheist systems presented by Ādi Śaṅkarācārya in the Sarva-siddhānta-saṅgraha.

The SSS writes, “According to Lokāyatikas there are only four elements *viz.*, earth, water, fire, and air”¹ and the same is given in the SDS 1/6/6, (P 9).² The entirety of the system of philosophy discusses the following topics:

¹ लोकायतिकपक्षे तु तत्त्वं भूतचतुष्टयम् ।

पृथिव्यापस्तथा तेजो वायुरित्येव नापरम् ॥२/१॥

² अत्र चत्वारि भूतानि भूमिवार्यनलानिलाः ।

चतुर्भ्यः खलु भूतेभ्यश्चैतन्यमुपजायते ॥

Chapter 04

(01) The world (जगत्), (02) The means of proof (प्रमाणानि), (03) The absolute goal or destination (मोक्षः/मुक्तिः), (04) The practice or method (उपासना/साधना) of attainment of the same, (05) The form, nature or characteristic of the God (देवः/ईश्वरः) and (06) The nature or type of experience (अनुभूतिः) of the state of liberation.

Before the system-wise analysis of each of the atheist (नास्तिक) systems it would be proper here to present the tenets presented by Ādi Śaṅkarācārya in his Sarva-siddhānta-saṅgraha(= SSS) and Svāmī Vidyāraṇya in his Sarva-darśana-saṅgraha (=SDS), though the order of presentation of the atheist and the theist systems (dealt with in the next chapter 04) is a bit different on the ground of the system nearer to the Absolute Monism (केवलद्वैत), according to both the authors individually.

The SSS contains 12 chapters called प्रकरणम् presenting Introductory followed by 11 doctrines in 537 verses while the SDS presents doctrines in prose divided into 16 chapters. The SDS commences directly with the Cārvākas (though SSS calls it Lokāyatikas).

The latter order is also changed i.e. the Ārhatas are presented in No. 03 and the Bauddhas in No. 04 (with their 04 sects) in the SSS, while SDS gives the second position to the Bauddhas (CH 02) and the third to the Ārhatas (CH 03), though both have thought of a special sequence of presenting the doctrines.

Chapter 04

The SSS presents the 10 doctrines in their rising order being nearer to the Śāṅkara Vedānta, while the sequence in the SDS is from the point of view of gradation in being a strong Atheist (नास्तिक), less Atheist (but believers in the Vedas) and so on upto the Śāṅkara Vedānta.

The contents of the SDS here is the passing reference to the systems dealt with by Mādhava. There are altogether sixteen systems of philosophy collected by him in the SDS. (01) The³ Cārvāka System, (02) The Buddhist System, (03) The Ārhat or Jaina System, (04) The Rāmānuja System of Qualified Monism, (05) The Mādhva System of Dualism, (06) The Pāśupata System of Nakuliśa, (07) The Śaiva System, (08) The Pratayabhijñā System or Kashmir Śaivism, (09) The Mercurial or Raseśvara System, (10) The Vaiśeṣika System of Kaṇāda, (11) The Nyāya System of Gautama, (12) The Mīmāṃsā System of Jaiminī, (13) The Grammatical System of Pāṇini, (14) The Sāṅkhya System, (15) The Yoga System of Patañjali, and (16) Śāṅkara System of Absolute monism.

There is some definite principle upon the order of these systems is based. As a general rule the less acceptable principles are put in the beginning and the most desirable one at the end. Hence the nāstika (heterodox or non-Vedic) systems are treated at the outset and then the turn of āstika system comes. The former are of two kinds, viz. those based on perception or holding gross ideas and those based on reasoning. The layman's view is represented by the Cārvākas who dwell upon the most ordinary and external aspect of the thing. Though they do not possess any philosophy as such to be

³ For details see Umashankar Sharma: Sarva-darśana-saṅgraha, pp. 8-9.

Chapter 04

recorded but their outlook towards life (01), the world (02) and such principles as soul (03), God (04) and liberation (05) is noticeable. In doing so Mādhava has recorded the other extreme of Indian philosophy. The Nāstika systems based on reasoning are either the Buddhists holding all existence to be momentary or Jainas propounding it to be conditional (स्याद्वादः). The Buddhists possess a comparatively gross view while maintaining ākāś (the sky) to be a kind of non-existence whereas the Jainas take it to be a positive category. Thus their order of presentation is beyond doubt.⁴

The atheist (*Nāstika*) systems of philosophy:

Cārvākas or Lokāyatikas (Bṛhaspati's doctrine) (SSS CH 02)

It is interesting to know the dictionary meaning of the name चार्वाकः Name of a sophistical philosopher said to have been a pupil⁵ of बृहस्पतिः - (1) Name of the preceptor of the gods. (2) The planet Jupiter. (3) Name of the author of a Smṛti.⁶ (i) Lord of prayer or devotion, Name of a deity (in whom Piety and Religion are personified, he is the chief offerer of prayers and sacrifices, and therefore represented as the type of priestly order, and the *Purohita* of the gods with whom he intercedes of men; in a later times he is the god of wisdom and eloquence, to whom various works are

⁴ In SDS of the āstika systems of the Rāmānuja (1019-1139) philosophy of Qualified Monism (Viśiṣṭādvaita) belongs to the *tārkika* class because it is based on inference supported by argument rather than on Scripture (श्रुति). The same is the case with the Madhva system (called Pūrṇaprajña in the SDS). But their difference is that while Madhva (is आनन्दतीर्थ, 1120-1199) directly insists on the theory of difference (*bheda*) maintaining Dualism, Rāmānuja, though accepting difference at least in treatment, does not stick to it and explains it in terms of qualification of the Supreme Self or Brahman.

⁵ Apte V. S.: Sanskrit Dictionary, P 207, Col. 02

⁶ Ibid. P 394, Col. 01

Chapter 04

ascribed; he is also regarded as son of Āngiras, husband of Tārā and father of Kaca, and sometimes identified with Vyāsa, in astronomy he is the regent of Jupiter and often identified with that planet).⁷

According to the Cārvākas as Ādi Śaṅkarācārya writes,

(01) The world (जगत्): There is no other world higher than this nor heaven (स्वर्गः) nor hell (नरकः). The worlds of Śiva, etc. are invented by ignorant impostors (प्रतारकः). Its tastes in partaking are: Sweet, Sour, etc. The miseries of hell are the pain caused by enemies, etc.

(02) The means of proof (प्रमाणानि): There is only the direct perception which exists, because that which is not perceivable is non-existent (2/2-3).

(03) The absolute goal (मोक्ष/मुक्तिः): The Absolution is death (itself) i.e. the cessation (निवर्तनम्) of the principal vital air (प्राणवायु) (2/8-10).

(04) The practice or method (उपासना/साधना): In order to get liberation no one should take trouble in penances, fasting, etc. The conventions like chastity gifts and sweet dinner are invented by the hungry ones. The temples, houses for drinking water, etc. are of no use. The rituals, the Vedas, the smearing with ashes are a means of livelihood (2/11-14).

⁷ Williams M. Moniar: Sanskrit-English Dictionary, Pub: Motilal Banarsidass Delhi, P 737, col. 01.

Chapter 04

(05) The nature of God (देवः/ईश्वरः): They do not believe in any god or higher entity.

(06) The type of experience (अनुभूतिः) of the state of liberation: One feels pleasure or pain by nature and not by merit or demerit. A wise man should enjoy pleasures in this world by means like agriculture, the cattle-rearing (गोरक्ष्य), trade, politics (दण्ड) and administration (नीति), etc. (2/15).

According to the Cārvākas as Svāmī Vidyāranya writes that the king is the Lord and none else. The part of consciousness in the body is called to have the knowledge and the body is insentient. The souls are many and are of the medium size (मध्यमपरिमाणः).

Jainas or Ārhatas (SSS CH 03)

According to the Ārhatas as Ādi Śaṅkarācārya writes,

(01) The world (जगत्): The world exists and hence the heat of fire, the coolness of water, the sound of the cuckoos, etc. are due to the variable nature. Similarly pleasure and pain are transient and they determine merit and demerit in the form of the invisible results of previous actions (अ-दृष्ट).

(02) The means of proof (प्रमाणानि): They accept 03 means of proof viz. Perception (प्रत्यक्ष), Inference (अनुमानम्), and Scripture (आगम).

Chapter 04

(03) The absolute goal (मोक्ष/मुक्ति:): The liberation consists in the souls having no bondage or the obstructive covering of the knowledge.

(04) The practice or method (उपासना/साधना): The liberation results from the combination of knowledge and works taught by the spiritual preceptor. One should not cause any pain to any living being, but should move about naked (दिगम्बर) and should observe celibacy. One should practise postures like *Vīrāsanam* and should eat out of their own hands engaging in silent meditation.

(05) The nature of God (देवः/ईश्वरः): God is the omniscient, Holy Master of the world (जगद्+गुरुः) and is established as an authority on the final freedom He should be followed by all.

(06) The type of experience (अनुभूतिः) of the state of liberation: SSS is silent about the state of experience.

According to the Ārhatas, Svāmī Vidyāranya writes that the Jainas accept 02 means of proof viz. Perception and Inference omitting the Scripture. They advocate the theory of Three Gems viz. Right Conduct, Right Vision and Right Knowledge are the means of liberation.

Bauddhas (Saugatas) (SSS CH 04)

It would be appropriate to have a glimpse of the short life history of Gautama Buddha⁸ here. Gautama Buddha was born as the son of

⁸ Shri Ramkrishna Math, Thus Spake The Buddha, Mylapore, 2002.

Chapter 04

Śuddhodana and Mayādvēī at Lumbini near Kapilvastu. He was named Siddhārtha - one who has accomplished his purpose. Śuddhodhana invited a sage to see the royal child. On seeing the child sage prophesied, 'The supernatural signs indicate that the newborn child will bring deliverance to the whole world.' He, of course, warned the king that the boy might renounce the world any time if he should come across the diseased, the old and the dead. The king was very much alarmed to hear this. He got Siddhārtha married at an early age and almost imprisoned him in a pleasure garden providing therein all kinds of enjoyments. The unwanted event happened. Once in the course of his visit to the city, came across an old man, a diseased person, a dead body and at last a monk. Siddhartha was very much perturbed and plunged into deep thought.

When he came back to the palace, somebody brought him the news that his wife Yaśodharā had given birth to a male child, who was named Rāhula. Instead of being happy, Siddhartha thought, 'It is bondage heaped on bondage', and decided to renounce the world in search of truth. The decision was put into action. When one night Siddhārtha renounced everything to fulfill the goal of his life and became a recluse, he came to Buddha Gaya and sat there beneath a tree, with a view to attain Enlightenment. After six years of hard questions the much desired enlightenment dawned upon him, he became Bodhisattva and started preaching the new gospel. Buddha delivered his first sermon at Sārnāth near Vārāṇsī. He preached the message, established well-organized order of monks he passed away at Kuśinara at the age of eighty on a Vaiśākha Pūrṇimā (as on this day he was born and also attained enlightenment, the day is called Buddha Pūrṇimā).

Chapter 04

According to the Bauddhas as Ādi Śaṅkarācārya writes that there are four classes of the Buddhas by reason of their difference in views with their scriptures impelling men to live according to their qualifications. The four kinds are: (1) Mādhyamikas (in Vv. 01-17), (2) Yogācāras (in Vv. 18-25), (3) Sautrāntikas (in Vv. 26-33) and (4) Vaibhāṣikas (in Vv. 34-73) taking their stand respectively on (1) action (क्रिया), (2) divinity (देवता), (3) the meditation (योग) and (4) nothingness (शून्यम् पदम्).

They are unanimous in the determination of the nature of the inner principle of the ego, but they dispute mutually regarding the outer world of common phenomenal experience.

(01) The world (जगत्): The world is cognised differently by the Vaibhāṣika as the external objects established through direct perception, by the Sautrāntika: the external objects inferred from the forms of consciousness, by the Yogācāra the consciousness is taken as the only real, while by the Mādhyamika: the consciousness is not at all accepted. Hence for them all things are momentary.

The whole collection of objects (प्रपञ्चजातमखिलं) constitutes the world (भवनम्) comprises of the fivefold mundane consciousness, twelve fold inner seats (आयतन) and eighteen material components of the body which are made up of atoms (अणु+कल्पितः). The elements (धातु) Earth, Water (आपः), Light and Air possess the qualities like solidity (स्थैर्यम्) (& shape, etc.), fluidity (द्रवत्वम्) (etc.), heat and cold (शीतता). The putting together of color (वर्ण), smell (गन्ध), taste (रस),

Chapter 04

and heat (ओजः), produce the four elements which are all aggregates of ultimate atoms.

Through deluded vision, the Body (शरीरम्), i.e. the world, is imagined (imagined) as constituted of fivefold composition (पञ्चधा), of name, class, quality, substance, and the action.

(02) The means of proof (प्रमाणानि): The Mādhymikas advocating momentariness accept no means of proof. The Yogācāras accept the Perception, while the Sautrāntikas and the Vaibhāṣikas accept the Perception and the Inference.

They accept two means of proof: (1) Direct perception free from superimposition (कल्पना) of five kinds which are - Name, Class, Quality, Substance and Action. (2) The logical inference is the knowledge of a substance (लिङ्गी) characterized by the sign or mark (लिङ्गम्). The ignorance is removed by perception and inference.

(03) The absolute goal (मोक्ष/मुक्ति:): Gautama Bauddha declares the Absolution (मोक्षः)⁹ to be a faultless state of consciousness that results at the cessation of the ignorance.

(04) The practice or method (उपासना/साधना): The qualified persons receive the knowledge of the ultimate truth through the means (मान), the object (मेय) and the result (फल), etc. One should

⁹ It is interesting to note that Ādi Śaṅkarācārya has employed the term निर्वाणम् of the Buddhists in the chapter of Kumārilabhaṭṭa i.e. in SSS CH 08/02.

Chapter 04

perform the duties like worship of the sanctuary (चैत्य) and others, prescribed in the scriptures (आगमोदिताः) of Buddha.

(05) The nature of God (देवः/ईश्वरः): The Lord (ईश्वर) declared by the Vaiśeṣikas and others is not admitted by the Bauddhas and hence they disprove (निराक्रियते) Him, but they accept the knower of the truth regarding the avoidable and the acceptable (हेयोपादेय-तत्त्वम्) as well as the one who is the means for the Absolution.

Buddha knowing what is worthy of adoption and rejection (हेयोपादेयमात्रज्ञः), is accepted as a true teacher and guide.

(06) The type of experience (अनुभूतिः) of the state of liberation: The Yoga produces the supreme wisdom that uproots all attachments characterized by the giving up of all likes and dislikes, free from all intrinsic duality and equaled, to pure firmament (आकाशवत्).

According to the Bauddhas as Svāmī Vidyāranya writes that the Bauddhas accepts 02 means of proof viz. Perception and Inference. They believe that Gautama Bauddha is the Lord.

Vaiśeṣikas (SSS CH 05)

The Vaiśeṣika system originated independently about the beginning of the Christian era.¹⁰ The Vaiśeṣika system has their own Sūtras which are regarded as the basis of their doctrines. The Vaiśeṣika system is also known as the system of Kaṇāda or Aulūka. Kaṇāda (probably a nick-name due to his having propounded the

¹⁰ Gajendragadkar A. B. & Karmarkar R. D.: Tarkasaṃgraha of Annambhaṭṭa, Introduction, P III.

Chapter 04

theory of Kaṇas or atome) was the son of Ulūka, of Kaśyapa gotra. He is said to have be so called (Kaṇāda or Kaṇabhakṣa), because he maintained himself of rice-grains fallen in streets like a pigeon. According to another tradition God revealed himself to Kaṇāda God revealed himself to Kaṇāda who was practicing penance, in the form of an owl to expound the six Padārthas, hence the system received the name Aulūkyadarśana. Kautīlya does not mention the Vaiśeṣikas by name, but Nāgārjuna and Āryadeva (about the 3rd Century AD) criticize their doctrines. The Vaiśeṣikasūtras may therefore be said to have been composed bout the first Century A.D.¹¹

According to the Vaiśeṣikas, Ādi Śaṅkarācārya writes,

(01) The world (जगत्): Actions (कर्माणि) are incapable of bestowing their own fruits, as they are non-intelligent (अचेतन), to bestow the fruit. The Primordial Matter, the ultimate atoms and Time being non-intelligent, can not be the giver of fruits. Therefore some other Being, different from all these, must be the giver of the fruits (of works). The Being, knowing all living creatures and their places is admitted to be the Omniscient One unlike that of the Bauddhas who adopt the One knows only the things that are worthy of acceptance and rejection (हेयोपादेय) as well as not different from ourselves.

One must place faith in the invisible things (अदृश्योः) heaven (स्वर्ग) and the Absolution (अपवर्ग) on the basis of just one part of the Vedas (वेदैकदेशम्) teaching about the production of the visible rainfall through the *Kārīrī* sacrifice and the attainment of sons as well as cattle from the *Citrā* and other sacrifices.

¹¹ Vide. Ibid, Introduction, P III.

Chapter 04

(02) The means of proof (प्रमाणानि): The means of proof are 03 viz. Perception, Inference, and Scripture.

(03) The absolute goal (मोक्ष/मुक्ति:): The Vaiśeṣikas consider that the absolution (मोक्ष) results through the knowledge (परिज्ञानात्) as well as the realization of the similarity and dissimilarity of the six categories (षट्पदार्थ) like substance, quality, action, higher as well as lower generality, individuality and intimate relation comprising of the Lord, the individual souls, and the whole of this world.¹²

The Absolution (मोक्ष) consisting in the cessation of the activity of the instruments (of the soul) (करणोपरमात्मकः) results through His grace (तत्प्रसादेन) by means of devotion to the Supreme Lord. In that condition the soul exists like a stone, because they (वैशेषिकाः) believe that the destruction of pleasure is like the destruction of pain. Therefore, after cultivating detachment (निर्वाण) from the worldly existence (संसार), the person desirous of attaining absolution (मुमुक्षु), obtains it.

(04) The practice or method (उपासना/साधना): By way of the logic of elimination (पारिशेष्यतः) of the souls, the Lord alone is the giver of the fruits of (their) actions (कर्म) and none else like Primordial Matter, the ultimate atoms, etc. Otherwise the individual souls would prevent by (their own) efforts the unwished-for (अप्रार्थितानि) miseries. The 06 categories should be realized (ज्ञेयाः), as

¹² षट् पदार्था इमे ज्ञेयास्तन्मयं सकलं जगत् ।

तेषां साधर्म्यवैधर्म्यज्ञानं मोक्षस्य साधनम् ॥५/३०॥

Chapter 04

the whole world is made up of them. The realization of their similarities (साधर्म्य) and dissimilarity (वैधर्म्य) is the means of Absolution (मोक्ष).

(05) The nature of God (देवः/ईश्वरः): The soul located within substances, is of 02 kinds: the individual soul (जीव) as in the gods, men, the lower animals, etc. and the Supreme Soul (पर) the Great Lord (महेश्वरः).

(06) The type of experience (अनुभूतिः) of the state of liberation: A person performing the duties enjoined by Him is freed (मुच्यते), but one not performing such duties is bound in bondages (बद्धयते). The Vedas, the Smṛti-texts, the Rāmāyaṇa (इतिहास+आद्यम्) the Purāṇas, the Mahābhārata, etc. are the commandment (आज्ञा) of the Lord and should not be transgressed (लङ्घ्या) by the believers in the Vedas (वेदिकैः). The Creator (जगत्कर्ता) is realized (अवगम्यते) through the 03 means of proof. Therefore by performing the works enjoined by Him satisfy (तृप्तये) Him solely.

According to the Vaiśeṣikas, Svāmī Vidyāranya writes, the Vaiśeṣikas accept 02 means of proof viz. Perception and Inference omitting the Scripture.

Naiyāyikas (SSS CH 06)

The system of Naiyāyikas originated independently about the beginning of the Christian era.¹³ Gautama is the author of the Nyāyasūtras. In the Pratimānāṭakam of Bhāsa, the Nyāyaśātra of

¹³ Gajendragadkar A. B. & Karmarkar R. D.: Tarkasaṅgraha of Annambhaṭṭa, Introduction, P III.

Chapter 04

Medhātithi is referred to. According to the Mahābhārata, Gautama and Medhātithi refer to the same person. Dr. Satischandra Vidyābhūṣaṇa regards this Medhātithi Gautama as the founder of Ānvīkṣikī, and thus quite a different person from Gautama Akṣapāda the founder of the Nyāya system.

Akṣapāda literally means 'having eyes on the feet.' Absurd traditions are in vogue to account for this appellation. One tradition says that Gautama was given a second pair of eyes on the feet by God, as he happened to fall in a well, being absorbed in his meditations. According to another account, Gautama once looked at his pupil Vyāsa with the eyes on his feet !

Vātsyāyana wrote his famous commentary on the Nyāyasūtras about the fourth century A.D. It is therefore safe to say that Gautama Akṣapāda must have lived at least a century or two earlier than Vātsyāyana.¹⁴

According to the Naiyāyikas, Ādi Śaṅkarācārya writes,

(01) The world (जगत्): The lord of all is inferred to be the Creator of the world by the syllogism (अनुमानम्). All the earth, the mountains (भूधर), etc., have the Omniscient Being (सर्ववित्) as the cause of the Creation, because they are the produced effects (कार्यत्वात्) like pots (produced by a potter). Heaven and the Absolution (अपवर्गः) come only to those who faithfully perform the works ordained in the Vedas and the Smṛtis but never to the heretics (पाखण्डिनाम्). The shower of rain on the performance of the sacrifice

¹⁴ Gajendragadkar A. B. & Karmarkar R. D.: Tarkasaṅgraha of Annarībhāṭṭa, P iv.

Chapter 04

known as *Karīrīṣṭi* explains by means of reasoning, etc. the visible result in the unseen things, viz. heaven and the Absolution (अपवर्ग).

(02) The means of proof (प्रमाणानि): The four means of proof here (in this system), viz., perception and what is called inference, comparison (or analogy), and scripture. Comparison, however, is not admitted by some (as a means of proof). Perception is (firstly) that of ourselves and of others (similar to us); and there is also (secondly) another (kind of it), viz. that of the yogis (or transcendental seers).

(03) The absolute goal (मोक्ष/मुक्ति:): The Absolution (मुक्ति:) results from the knowledge of the 16 topics like (1) the means of proof, (2) the object of knowledge, (3) settled conclusion, (4) the doubt, (5) purpose (or motive), (6) example, (7) demonstration, premises, reasoning, discussion, controversy, cavilling, fallacy, perversion, self-confutation and also final refutation. And from the union i.e. the outcome of loving devotion directed to Hari (or the God Viṣṇu).¹⁵

(04) The practice or method (उपासना/साधना): Lord Śiva, though bodiless, acts out of His own free will (इच्छया), as He possesses the 03 attributes (गुणाः) like Desire, Knowledge and Effort (इच्छाज्ञानप्रयत्नाः) and they are like the essential characteristics of atoms. It is a fact that effect, action and efforts are interdependent as of persons like us (अस्माभिरस्मदादिक्रिया यथा). The logical reasoning supporting the right knowledge is associated with three dialectic processes (कथा+त्रय) viz. discussion (वादः), controversy (जल्पः) and

¹⁵ मोक्षो हि हरिभक्त्याप्तयोगेनेति पुरोदितः ॥ ६/४३ ॥

Chapter 04

cavil (वितण्डा). A discussion of the student with the teacher leads to the learning of the truth (तत्त्वबुभुत्सया).

(05) The nature of God (देवः/ईश्वरः): The existence of the Lord is accepted by the Naiyāyikas in accordance with the doctrine of Vaiśeṣikas who propound that the soul located within substances, is of 02 kinds: the individual soul and the Supreme Soul. The Vedas, etc. are the commandment of the Lord who as the Creator (जगत्कर्ता) is realized through the 03 means of proof and through whose grace (तत्प्रसादेन) results the Absolution (मोक्ष) consisting in the cessation of the activity of the instruments of the soul by means of the devotion to the Supreme Lord.

Lord Śiva has to be accepted as no other than an Omniscient Being, because Time, Karma, Prakṛti, etc., being non-intelligent (अचैतन्यात्) and individual souls are all possessed of very limited knowledge (अल्पज्ञत्वात्).

(06) The type of experience (अनुभूतिः) of the state of liberation: The yogis see everything (सर्वम्) through the grace (प्रसादतः) of the Lord, while the Lord sees with the eye of knowledge naturally (स्वभावतः). Others with physical eyes (मांसचक्षुषः) do not realize. One performing the works enjoined in the Vedas and satisfying the Lord, attains His grace through the power of Yoga (योगेन) followed by the Absolution (मोक्षम्) of the form of Bliss (नित्यानन्द) full of devotion, but not the state like that of the वैशेषिक्स who believe to experience the state like a stone (पाषाणवत्+अवस्थितिः).

Chapter 04

According to the Naiyāyikas, Svāmī Vidyāranya writes that the means of proof are 04 viz. Perception, Inference, Testimony and Comparison. Lord is not the material cause but the instrumental or efficient cause (निमित्तकारण) of the world and He is the bestower of the fruits of actions.

Prābhākaras (SSS CH 07)

According to the Prābhākaras, Ādi Śaṅkarācārya writes,

(01) The world (जगत्): According to him, there are five categories, viz. substance, quality, action, generality and subordination which are eight along with power, similarity and number. There is neither particularity nor the non-existence.

(02) The means of proof (प्रमाणानि): The threefold cognition of objects depending on the (perceiving) person (कर्ता), the object of knowledge (विषयरूपेण), and the knowledge (ज्ञानम्).

(03) The absolute goal (मोक्ष/मुक्ति:): The work ordained in the Vedas bestows the Absolution (मोक्ष).

(04) The practice or method (उपासना/साधना): A person becomes bound, when he performs desirable i.e. selfish or prohibited actions. The Vedas are divisible into four kinds, as mandatory injunctions (विधि), explanatory passages (अर्थवाद), metrical hymns (मन्त्र:), and names (नामधेयम्). The mandatory injunctions teach what constitute धर्म and what अधर्म. As e.g. 'The Self has to be known (आत्मा ज्ञातव्य:)' in the Upaniṣads.

Chapter 04

The Prabhākaras contempt the Vaiśeṣikas who hold that the Absolution (मुक्तिः) results from the cessation of the activities of the instruments (करणोपरमात्) which is merely a stone-like (पाषाणवत्) state of the existence resulting from the destruction of volitional effort, etc.

The ritualistic works like sacrifices being enjoined in the Scripture have to be performed, As they create sin of omission (प्रत्यवायः).

(05) The nature of God (देवः/ईश्वरः): The Self is different from the intellect, the senses, and the body (बुद्धीन्द्रियशरीरेभ्यः), and is all pervading (विभुः) and unchanging (ध्रुवः).

(06) The type of experience (अनुभूतिः) of the state of liberation: The persons solely depend upon (एकशरणाः) Vedic works will attain Supreme well being (श्रेयः).

Svāmī Vidyāranya does not give separately Prabhākara's system of philosophy, but discussed under the Jaimini-darśana, he writes that Mīmāṃsikas known as Prābhākaras recognize 06 means of proof viz. perception, inference, verbal testimony, analogy, presumption and *anuplabdhi*.

Bhāṭṭas (SSS CH 08)

This fact has a stronger support of the statement of the Vedāntasamuccaya which affirms that the Buddhism quitted its

Chapter 04

homeland possibly due to the vehement refutation launched by Kumārila bhaṭṭa.¹⁶

According to the believers of Bhaṭṭācārya, Ādi Śaṅkarācārya writes,

(01) The world (जगत्): The Vedic sentence turns men from the forbidden, or makes them become engaged in the performance of prescribed duties (चोदना) and it is indicated by the Potential Mood, Imperative Mood, the Passive Participles, etc. (लिङ्लोट्-तव्यादि-लङ्छितम्). An explanatory passage censures forbidden things or praises the injunctions. The sacrificial formulas constitute elements of rituals and they throw light on what has to be accomplished. The names (नामधेय) are the names of sacrifices, etc.

The persons involved in the voluntary works attain the desired objects to be enjoyed only after being born again. A person performing the works prohibited by the Scriptures, is born in the form of worms, insects, etc. (कृमिकीटादिरूपेण) to go to hell. A person performing the works enjoined (in the Vedas) and practising the Yogic techniques like the Sense-withdrawal realises the Self through the mind as the instrument (मनःकरणकेन).

(02) The means of proof (प्रमाणानि): Perception, Inference, Analogical Comparison (उपमानम्), Circumstantial Presumption (अर्थापत्ति), and Negative (अभाव) do not teach duty. Perception, gives rise to the knowledge of existing things by means of the contact of

¹⁶ ..तदेतत् बोद्धोदयावसरे क्रमेणापचीयमानं प्रायो नामशेषतामुपगतमभूत् । बौद्धानां प्रचारातिशयं तत्त्वविद्यां च नामशेषामवलोक्य श्रीकुमारिलभट्टस्य प्रयत्नेन वेदानां वेदान्तस्य च पुनरोद्धारोऽजायत । cf. Vedānta-samuccayaḥ, Ed. by. Sharma Brahmarṣi Harerāma, *prastāvanā*, P 1.

Chapter 04

the senses (with the things). Inference depends upon an invariable concomitant and hence it does not evidently give rise to the knowledge of duty and non-duty. Analogical Comparison is not possible as there is nothing that resembles duty, etc. and it apprehends similarities. Circumstantial Presumption helps to arrive at a general proposition that the duty is the cause of pleasure and non-duty is the cause of pain.

(03) The absolute goal (मोक्ष/मुक्ति:): A person with his mind purified and giving up both the voluntary (काम्य) as well as the prohibited (निषिद्ध) works enjoined in the Scriptures, attains the Absolution (निर्वाणम्). The work enjoined exclusively by the Vedas yields the Absolution (मोक्षदम्), but not the voluntary nor the prohibited.

(04) The practice or method (उपासना/साधना): The Lord is worthy to be worshipped and meditated upon by means of the *mantras traiyambaka*, etc. for those who are desirous of the Absolution (मुमुक्षुभिः). One should perform the daily obligatory and the occasionally works in order to avoid the sin of omission (प्रत्यवाय).

(05) The nature of God (देवः/ईश्वरः): The Self is both differentiated when in the form of individual souls and undifferentiated as the Supreme Soul. The individual souls are unreal (असत्) and the Supreme Self is real (सत्) (37cd-38).

The Supreme Soul (परमात्मा) has to be understood to exist as if continuously threaded (अनुस्यूत) through (all) the individual souls.

Chapter 04

(06) The type of experience (अनुभूतिः) of the state of liberation:

The knowledge of the Supreme Self taught (प्रतिपादिते) in the passages like “The Self should be known” (आत्मा ज्ञातव्यः) arises in the individual Self. In the state of Absolution, the seekers experience the eternal bliss (नित्यानन्दानुभूतिः) without the objects of the senses. They become free from attachment (विक्ताः) to the objects of the senses, and reach the state from which there is no returning (अ-पुनरावृत्तिम्).

Svāmī Vidyāranya does not give separately Bhaṭṭācārya’s system of philosophy, but discussed under the Jaimini-darśana, he writes that Mīmāṃsikas known as Bhāṭṭa recognize 05 means of proof viz. perception, inference, verbal testimony, analogy and presumption.

Sāṃkhyas (SSS CH 09)

According to the Sāṃkhyas, Ādi Śaṅkarācārya writes,

(01) The world (जगत्): From the discrimination of the manifest and the unmanifest, the knowledge of the individual soul (पुरुष) results, and through which the absolute cessation of the 03 miseries (दुःखत्रयनिवृत्तिः) arises.

The world is made up of the principles. Every thing is a product of the Primordial Matter which is eternal, one, and non-intelligent (जडता). Although he (the आत्मन्) is passively indifferent, gets influenced by the 03 Qualities of the Primordial Matter, and appears as if he were an agent. The Creation arises through their association like that of a lame with a blind one (पङ्क्त्ययोगवत्). The Primordial Matter (प्रकृति) forms the equilibrium (साम्यम्) of the three Qualities,

Chapter 04

viz. the Sattva (सत्त्व), Rajas (रजस्) and Tamas (तमस्). When the सत्त्व grows, pleasure and other 09 qualities are born. When the रजस् grows, covetousness and other 06 qualities are born. When the तमस् grows, drowsiness and other 06 qualities are born. The Cosmic Intelligence (महत्) is produced out of the Primordial Matter, and out of this (Cosmic Intelligence) the principle of egoity (अहङ्कारः), out of which are produced the 05 rudimentary principles (तन्मात्राणि) and they are subtle.

From these 05 organs (of action), 05 sense objects and also 05 gross elements are produced in the subtle condition like a cloth, produced out of white threads, is purely in accordance with the three Qualities. The 05 sense organs are produced out of the सत्त्व by means of these, he (i.e. पुरुष) perceives the sense objects like sound and others. The organs of action have been produced out of the रजस् and then from them are derived the activities like speaking and so on. The internal organ मनः is the 11th organ and, from the तमः, the Earth and other elements have been born.

(02) The means of proof (प्रमाणानि): The means of proof are not mentioned by the author in this system of philosophy.

(03) The absolute goal (मोक्ष/मुक्ति:): According to Kapila the Absolution (मुक्तिम्) results through knowledge (ज्ञानेन), while according to Patañjali it results from practical application (योगेन). A Yogin is in need of the knowledge of the principles of the system of Kapila (03). The Absolution (मोक्षः) resulting from other means (than that of the Sāṃkhya), gets decayed and never results by means of medicinal herbs, sacrifices based on the 03 Qualities (08-09). The

Chapter 04

Absolution (अपवर्गः) results exclusively from knowledge, while one gets into the bondage (बध्यते) due to ignorance.

(04) The practice or method (उपासना/साधना): If the sacrifices performed with the dedication to the Brahman (ब्रह्मापर्णतया) give rise to the Absolution, it means that they are not the sacrifices and the meaning of the *Mantras* (to be used) aims at something other (than itself). Sacrifices and other duties lead one to the worldly existence (संसारेषु), while the prohibited actions give rise to the prosperity.

(05) The nature of God (देवः/ईश्वरः): The souls (आत्मानः) absorb into the Primordial Matter at the time of universal dissolution with their subtle bodies influenced by the Qualities and their own actions. They assume various physical forms of Brahmā and other inanimate objects. Any person maybe belonging to any stage of life, acquiring the knowledge of 25 principles gets the clear knowledge of the Self (आत्मज्ञानम्).

(06) The type of experience (अनुभूतिः) of the state of liberation: The scriptural injunctions like आत्मा ज्ञातव्यः etc. relate to duties refraining one from worldly activity (निवृत्तिरूपः), and leading to the Absolution. The other duties lead one to (worldly) activity, like *Agniṣṭoma*, and other sacrifices. The righteousness leads to the higher worlds (ऊर्ध्वगतिः) and the unrighteousness leads to lower worlds (अधोगतिः).

According to the Sāṃkhyas, Svāmī Vidyāraṇya writes, there are three means of proof perception, inference and verbal testimony. They accepted that the Self is all-pervaded and accepted the Lord is the Self.

Pātañjalas (SSS CH 10)

According to the Pātañjalas, Ādi Śaṅkarācārya writes,

(01) The world (जगत्): The world is made up of the 25 principles. They are: the individual soul (पुरुषः), the Primordial Matter (प्रकृति), the Cosmic Intelligence (महत्), the Egoity (अहङ्कारः), the 16 principles consisting of the rudimentary elements, the modifications, 05 gross elements. The body is made up of the 05 (great) elements, while the soul is the owner of the body (देही). The ignorance is the idea that sons, grandsons, etc., the offspring of the body, are all one's own (ममत्व) and also the enjoyable objects like houses, lands, etc.

(02) The means of proof (प्रमाणानि): The means of proof are not mentioned by the author in this system of philosophy.

(03) The absolute goal (मोक्ष/मुक्तिः): The Susumpnā is the path of Absolution wherein time is indeed deceived. Time consists of the moon and the sun with two paths.

(04) The practice or method (उपासना/साधना): One should practise the Yoga of Application (क्रियायोगम्) leading directly to the discipline of Yoga. The Yoga of Application consists of penance, silent repetition of prayer-formulas, and firm devotion to the Lord (ईश्वरे). One whose ignorance is destroyed (नष्टाविद्यः), who is free from desire and aversion and who is not desirous of the fruits of works here and there (इहामुत्रफलास्पृहः), should practice Yoga for Absolution (मुक्तये).

Chapter 04

(05) The nature of God (देवः/ईश्वरः): The Lord is free from the ‘afflictions’ and from the influence of the fructification (विपाकादिशून्यः) of actions and is omniscient. As He is not limited by time, He is the holy master (गुरुः) of Brahma and others. The mystic syllable Om (प्रणवः) is denotative of Him and its silent repetition (जपः) leads to the mental comprehension of what is denoted (by it) (वाच्यभावनम्).

(06) The type of experience (अनुभूतिः) of the state of liberation: The knowledge of the 25 principles and the Lord (पुरुषः) beyond the प्रकृति brings perfection in Yoga (योगसिद्धिः) which destroys the evil (दोषक्षयः). The destruction of laziness and other 13 obstacles in the practice of Yoga takes place and they all can be destroyed by means of the earnest worship of the Lord (ईश्वरप्रणिधानेन). The purification of the mind in Yoga has to be accomplished through the exercise, friendliness in relation to men of wisdom, pity in relation to persons in distress, satisfaction in relation to righteousness, indifference in relation to the sinful persons, devotional service in holy places and association with good people. All this purifies the mind of the Yogi and enables to conceive very minute as well as very big things.

The illumination of knowledge arises by (the practice of) 08 constituent parts of Yoga: (1) Internal self-control, (2) External regulation, (3) Postures, (4) Breath control, (5) Withdrawal of the senses from their respective objects, (6) Fixity of attention, (7) Meditative concentration, and (8) Self-realization.

The constant practice (01) the complexion of the body becomes beautiful, (02) within a year the hunger and thirst cease, (03) the

Chapter 04

various powers and perfections are produced, such as moving about as one desires, the knowledge relating to things of the long past, etc. (04) the purification of one's own body and senses, (05) the weakening of old age and death and (06) with the aid of renunciation there results the freedom from the recurrence of re-births (संसारे) .

The accomplished Yogi acquires 08 Powers, such as (01) becoming as minute as an atom (अणिमा), (02) becoming extremely light (लघिमा), (03) becoming extremely great (महिमा), (04) reaching things anywhere and from anywhere (प्राप्ति), (05) rulership (ईशता), (06) irresistible will (प्राकाम्य), (07) masterful-ness (इशित्वम्) and (08) that power of subduing all things (वशित्व).

According to the Pātañjalas, Svāmī Vidyāraṇya writes that the means of proof are 03 viz. perception, inference and verbal testimony. The Lord is not the material cause (निमित्तकारण) and the instrumental or efficient cause (निमित्तकारण) of the world.

System of the Vedavyāsa (SSS CH 11)

According to the system of the Vedavyāsa, Ādi Śaṅkarācārya writes,

(01) The world (जगत्): The world is made from two elements, viz., the Person and the Primordial Matter, among which the higher (i.e. the Person), abides in the 'city' made up of the rudimentary elements which are the subtle characteristics called the three Qualities. The Primordial Matter denotes the (condition of) equalization of these Qualities (गुणसाम्यम्)¹⁷ called Sattva, Rajas and

¹⁷ Cp. Śrīmadbhāgavata Mahāpurāṇa (3/26/10):

Chapter 04

Tamas. The nature of the Qualities decides a person as a soul of the best, the middling or of the worst kind. The persons endowed with those Qualities have the nature of water, fire and wind, i.e. white, red and black (in color). They are distinguished by means of their respective appearances, activities, etc. Viṣṇu Himself performs the creation, sustentation and destruction (सृष्टि+स्थिति+लयान्) taking in the names of Brahmā, Viṣṇu and Śiva who under the influence of the सत्त्वम्, रजः and तमः

(02) The means of proof (प्रमाणानि): The means of proof are not mentioned by the author in this system of philosophy. The chapter begins with, “The believers in the Vedas have derived the essence of the Vedas, from the Mahābhārata based on the system of the Sāṃkhyas and in agreement with all the scriptures (सर्वशास्त्राविरोधेन)”.

(03) The absolute goal (मोक्ष/मुक्ति:): A man is bound when swayed by the Qualities and emancipated from the bondage through the discriminative knowledge (विवेकधी:). Lord Viṣṇu is the bestower of Absolution (मोक्षदः) on all in consequence of their own works following the 03 Qualities of Satta, Rajas and Tamas.

(04) The practice or method (उपासना/साधना): One should wish knowledge, prosperity, health and Absolution (मोक्षम्) from Lord Śiva, the fire-god, the Sun-god and Lord Viṣṇu (जनार्दनात्) respectively. A person knowing his own duty (धर्मवित्) has to adopt his own duty in whatsoever category (पक्षे) he is born here. Those endowed with the Quality of सत्त्वम् must adopt the duties, enjoined in

यत्तत्त्रिगुणमव्यक्तं नित्यं सदसदात्मकम् । प्रधानं प्रकृतिं प्राहुरविशेषं विशेषवत् ॥

Chapter 04

the three Vedas, while those endowed with the रजः and तमः adopt the duties given out in the Atharvaveda and again they have to worship Viṣṇu,¹⁸ Brahmā and Śiva.

(05) The nature of God (देवः/ईश्वरः): Viṣṇu Himself takes the names of Brahmā, Viṣṇu and Śiva who under the influence of the सत्त्वम्, रजः and तमः.

(06) The type of experience (अनुभूतिः) of the state of liberation: Viṣṇu favours all and especially to those who perform their duty. One performing his own duties attains Absolution (मुच्यते).

The system of the Vedavyāsa, is not presented by Svāmī Vidyāraṇya in his Sarva-darśana-saṅgraha.

Vedānta (SSS CH 12)

Ādi Śaṅkarācārya according to his system of Vedānta (*Kevalādvaita*) writes,

(01) The world (जगत्): The universe of the five elements is produced out of Nescience. It is an illusory manifestation (विवर्तम्) of the Brahman. The Nescience is contrary to the true knowledge of the nature of the Self and it is declared to be beginning-less and existing in a gross as well as in a subtle form. The order of evolution is from the Self the element of ether is evolved; from ether the air, from the

¹⁸ The line 11/63ab वेदत्रयोक्ता ये धर्मास्तेऽनुष्ठेयास्तु सात्त्विकैः । (Just as our sacrifices culminate to us in the attainment of Viṣṇu, so also....) indicates (01) the involvement of the author in representing Vedavyāsa's view and (02) Vedavyāsa's doctrine is Sāttvika and hence the deity presiding over his doctrine is Lord Viṣṇu.

Chapter 04

air the fire, from this fire the water from the water the earth, and from the earth the paddy and other plants have arose. From plants the food comes forth; from the food the man of five sheaths. The creature (जनः) is made up of the subtle elements grossified. Beasts, men and gods are the varieties of such created beings. The food modifies into seven constituents of the body such as, the skin and others. Masculinity and femininity depend on the preponderance of the semen and the uterine blood respectively, while a eunuch is born, when the both are equal. The six vestures of the body like marrow of the bone and others are produced out of the semen as well as of the uterine blood. The six waves (or feelings) (षड्रम्यः) are hunger & thirst, sorrow & delusion, old age & death. The Self attains through meritorious works the world of the manes and the other such worlds, through prohibited works goes to the hell, etc.

(02) The means of proof (प्रमाणानि): Ādi Śaṅkarācārya divides the means of proof (प्रमाणम्) of two types on the basis of the reality (तत्त्वम्) and the phenomenal truth (व्यावहारिकं सत्यम्), the first is called the verbal testimony (शाब्दम्) and the second one has three divisions : (1-3) Direct Perception (प्रत्यक्षम्), Inference (अनुमानम्), Resemblance (उपमानम्) and (4) Verbal Testimony (आगमः), (5) Circumstantial Presumption (अर्थापत्ति) and (6) Negative Proof of non-perception (अभाव).

(03) The absolute goal (मोक्ष/मुक्तिः): The consciousness and Nescience, the witness of all things, consisting of non-intelligence and is always in possession of omniscience (79). In dreamless sleep and other states it is coated fast by Nescience, it is merely illusion

Chapter 04

(मायामात्रः) and is capable of remembering other re-births as an embodied being. It transcends the five states¹⁹ in which it manifests and is the knower (प्रमाता) that knows the Brahman.

(04) The practice or method (उपासना/साधना): A person performing injunctions and abstaining from the prohibitions declared in the Scriptures acquires knowledge and that too, without any instruction from a holy master (गुरुवाक्यानपेक्षया), is not right, because the true knowledge of the reality cannot be obtained by means of mere works.

It is declared in the Āruṇi that the knowledge arises through the favor of the holy master (गुरुप्रसाद). Works give an in-bent leaning to the mind and disappear like clouds at the end of the rainy season (प्रावृडन्ते घना इव). In the case of one whose mind is bent inwards, and being qualified to receive the knowledge of the Brahman, the sentences like “Thou art That” induce the enquiry into the Brahman (ब्रह्मजिज्ञासा) for which they are commented upon.

(05) The nature of God (देवः/ईश्वरः): The Self shines forth, after the five sheaths of the soul are declared with “not this, not this” (नेति नेति), which is the Supreme Brahman. All other is called the Nescience (अविद्या) that covers up and conceals the true nature of the Self. The Self is distinct from the body, the senses, the mind, the intellect, the vital airs and egoity. It is one in all bodies, immodifiable (निर्विकारः), untainted (निरञ्जनः), eternal, non-doer of actions, self-luminous, all-pervading and free from the experience of

¹⁹ The five states are: (1) Childhood (बाल्यम्) (2) Youth (कौमारम्) (3) Manhood (यौवनम्) (4) Old age (वार्धकम्) and (5) Death (मरणम्).

enjoyments (भोगविवर्जितः). The Self is one and even Supreme. It has the three worlds created for Itself by Itself. Its distinguishing conditions like bondage, freedom, etc. are possible (घटनाम्) as in dreams.

(06) The type of experience (अनुभूतिः) of the state of liberation:

One becomes a god through the righteousness, a beast becomes through the unrighteousness, while in case of equality of the both (the righteousness and the unrighteousness) a man is born. The Self becomes the doer and the enjoyer, when characterized by limiting adjuncts, gets polluted with desires, etc., and tainted within the body by means of Egoity, etc. Accordingly, being enveloped in the eightfold bondage (बन्धकाष्टकवेष्टितः) transmigrates in obedience to actions in bodies of Brahma to immoveable things (स्थावरान्तेषु), while through the wisdom (विद्यया), it attains the state of Brahman.

According to the Ādi Śaṅkarācārya system of Vedānta, Svāmī Vidyāraṇya writes the means of proof are 06 viz. Perception, Inference, Analogy, Scripture, Circumstantial Presumption (अर्थापत्तिः) and Non-perception. Supreme Self through His Illusory Power creates the world. And He becomes the doer and the bestower of the fruits of actions of all living beings.

- X - X - X - X -